

# Strengthening the Rule of Law in Europe

From a Common Concept to  
Mechanisms of Implementation

Edited by  
Werner Schroeder

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

# Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i> .....	xiii
-----------------------------------	------

## Part I: Introduction

<b>1. The European Union and the Rule of Law—State of Affairs and Ways of Strengthening</b> .....	3
<i>Werner Schroeder</i>	
I. Point of Departure: Dangers for the Rule of Law .....	3
II. Function of the Rule of Law in the Law of the Union .....	4
A. ‘Community Based on Law’ Means Respect for the Law .....	5
B. Rule of Law and Legal Protection as Maxims in the ECJ’s Jurisprudence .....	5
C. Rule of Law as Part of the Constitutionalisation Strategy .....	6
III. Rule of Law as Part of the Legal Order of the Union .....	9
A. Legal Homogeneity? .....	9
B. Rule of Law as Value and Principle .....	12
C. Normative Character of the Rule of Law .....	14
i. Binding Legal Norm .....	14
ii. Emanation into the Union Legal Order .....	15
iii. Basis for the Mutual Recognition of Legal Decisions of the Member States .....	16
iv. Respect for the Rule of Law in the Context of the Exercise of the Public Authority of the Union .....	18
IV. Content of the Rule of Law .....	19
A. Necessity of a Determination of the Content of the Rule of Law .....	19
B. Doubts Regarding the Usefulness of the Concept in Legal Terms .....	21
C. Formal and Material Aspects of the Union Rule of Law .....	22
D. Essence of the Union Rule of Law .....	25
V. Systemic Crises of the Rule of Law in the Member States .....	27
A. Risks for the Union Rule of Law Arising from Systemic Crises .....	28
B. Consequences of a ‘Systemic Deficit’ for the Respect of the Rule of Law .....	29

VI.	Procedure for the Implementation of the Rule of Law vis-à-vis the Member States .....	30
VII.	Conclusion—Strengthening of the Rule of Law Through Cooperation .....	32
<b>Part II: Core Elements of the Rule of Law</b>		
<b>2.</b>	<b>Principle of Legality and the Hierarchy of Norms .....</b>	<b>37</b>
	<i>Franz Merli</i>	
I.	Legality as the Core of the Rule of Law .....	37
II.	Legality as a Complex Concept.....	38
III.	Three Meanings of Legality.....	39
	A. Legality as Compliance with the Law.....	39
	B. Legality as Duty of the State .....	40
	C. Legality as Dominance of Parliamentary Law .....	41
IV.	Legality and the Quality of Law.....	42
V.	Legality and the Hierarchy of Norms .....	43
VI.	The Value of Legality .....	44
<b>3.</b>	<b>Access to Justice and Judicial Independence: Is There a Role for the EU? .....</b>	<b>46</b>
	<i>Attila Badó and János Bóka</i>	
I.	Current Issues Concerning Judicial Independence.....	47
II.	Selection and Promotion of Judges .....	50
III.	Assignment and Transfer of Cases, Secondment of Judges .....	53
IV.	Feasibility and Possibility of EU Activities Concerning Judicial Independence .....	58
V.	Conclusions .....	60
<b>4.</b>	<b>Transparency as Part of a European Rule of Law.....</b>	<b>61</b>
	<i>Inger Österdahl</i>	
I.	Introduction .....	61
II.	Access to Documents According to the European Court of Human Rights .....	66
	A. <i>Leander v Sweden</i> .....	66
	B. <i>Gaskin v United Kingdom</i> .....	67
	C. <i>Sdruzeni Jihoceske Matky v Czech Republic</i> .....	68
	D. <i>Társaság a Szabadságjogokért v Hungary</i> .....	69
	E. <i>Kenedi v Hungary</i> .....	71
	F. <i>Youth Initiative for Human Rights v Serbia</i> .....	72
	G. <i>Janowiec and Others v Russia</i> .....	74
	H. <i>Österreichische Vereinigung zur Erhaltung, Stärkung und Schaffung Eines Wirtschaftlich Gesunden Land- und Forstwirtschaftlichen Grundbesitzes v Austria</i> .....	74
III.	Tentative Conclusion.....	76
IV.	Looking Forward: Digitalisation, Internationalisation, Privatisation.....	77

<b>5. Legal Certainty</b> .....	80
<i>Anna Gamper</i>	
I. Introduction.....	80
II. Elements of Legal Certainty .....	81
A. Formal Certainty .....	81
i. Recognisability.....	81
ii. Predictability.....	81
B. Substantive Certainty .....	83
III. Problem Areas of Legal Certainty .....	85
A. Legal Certainty versus Legal Delegation.....	85
B. Legal Certainty versus Legality .....	86
C. Legal Certainty versus Evolutive Interpretation.....	88
D. Legal Certainty versus Separation of Powers .....	91
IV. Conclusions.....	95
<b>6. The Principle of Proportionality</b> .....	98
<i>Peter M Huber</i>	
I. Historic Roots of the Principle of Proportionality .....	98
A. From Hamurabbi to Common Law.....	98
B. Prussian Police Law of 1794.....	99
II. Adoption and Generalisation in German Constitutional Law .....	100
A. Contributions of Scholars .....	100
B. Jurisprudence of the Federal Constitutional Court.....	101
i. The Beginning in the 1950s .....	101
ii. Generalisation in the 1960s and 1970s.....	102
iii. Extension to the Equal Protection Clause.....	103
III. Acknowledgement in the Jurisprudence of International Courts and other Countries .....	104
A. European Court of Human Rights .....	104
B. European Court of Justice.....	105
C. Other National Legal Orders.....	106
IV. Five Elements of the Proportionality Test .....	106
V. Three Different Dimensions of Proportionality .....	107
A. Bipolar Legal Relationships between Individuals and the State.....	107
B. Multipolar Legal Relationships .....	107
C. Competence Related Dimension .....	108
i. European Union (Article 5(4) TEU).....	108
ii. <i>Grundgesetz</i> (Article 28(2) GG).....	109
VI. Problems.....	110
A. Standard of Scrutiny and Counter-majoritarian Difficulty .....	110
B. Open Questions.....	111

**Part III: Council of Europe and European Union—Different  
Concepts of the Rule of Law?**

<b>7. The Council of Europe and the Rule of Law</b> .....	115
<i>Jörg Polakiewicz and Jenny Sandvig</i>	
I. Introduction.....	115
II. Defining the Rule of Law within Europe.....	117
III. Monitoring Mechanisms and Other Rule of Law Activities.....	121
A. European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission).....	122
B. PACE Monitoring Committee .....	124
C. Group of States against Corruption (GRECO).....	126
D. European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice (CEPEJ).....	128
E. Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights.....	128
IV. Cooperation on the Rule of Law with the European Union .....	130
V. Concluding Observations.....	133
<b>8. The Rule of Law in the Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights</b> .....	135
<i>Elisabeth Steiner</i>	
I. Introduction.....	135
II. Attempting to Define the Rule of Law.....	136
III. The Rule of Law in the Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights .....	139
A. The Rule of Law as a Fundamental Principle of a Democratic Society .....	140
B. Guarantees that are Inherent to the Rule of Law .....	142
i. The Rule of Law and Judicial Oversight.....	142
ii. Due Process Guarantees.....	147
C. The Principle of Legality Under the Convention.....	150
i. The Quality of Law.....	151
IV. Concluding Remarks .....	154
<b>9. The Rule of Law in the Recent Jurisprudence of the ECJ</b> .....	155
<i>Thomas von Danwitz</i>	
I. Recent Jurisprudence of the ECJ on the Rule of Law .....	156
A. Effective Judicial Protection Against Restrictive Measures .....	157
B. Legislative Discretion and Judicial Scrutiny.....	159
C. Balancing Fundamental Rights.....	160
II. Ensuring the Respect of the Rule of Law by Member States of the European Union.....	162
A. Actual Context .....	163

B.	The Role of the ECJ in Ensuring the Respect of the Rule of Law by EU Member States .....	167
i.	Impressions of an Ongoing Integration Process .....	167
ii.	The Recent Constitutional Evolution in Hungary under Review by the ECJ.....	168
III.	Ensuring the Rule of Law—A Never Ending Story .....	169

#### **Part IV: Mechanisms of Implementing the Rule of Law in Europe**

<b>10.</b>	<b>Reinforcement of the Rule of Law Oversight in the European Union: Key Options.....</b>	<b>173</b>
	<i>Carlos Closa and Dimitry Kochenov</i>	
I.	Introduction .....	173
II.	Arguments in Favour of the Rule of Law Oversight.....	175
A.	The ‘What?’ Question: On the Nature of the Rule of Law Problems at Issue .....	175
B.	The ‘Why?’ Question: What does the EU have to do with all this? .....	177
i.	The All-affected Principle.....	177
ii.	The Supranational Federation Approach .....	178
iii.	The Principle of Congruence .....	179
III.	The Legal Basis for Reinforced EU Oversight.....	179
A.	Article 7 TEU.....	180
B.	Key Options Framing the Way Forward: What About the Treaty Change?.....	180
C.	Legal Bases Currently Available .....	182
i.	Articles 2 TEU and 4(2), 3(1) and 13(1) TEU Read Together.....	183
ii.	Articles 2 TEU and 19 TEU Read Together .....	184
iii.	Articles 2 TEU and 258 TFEU Deployed Together .....	184
iv.	Adding Article 260 TFEU .....	185
IV.	Oversight Procedures .....	186
A.	Key Components and Classifications of Procedures.....	187
i.	Brand-new Procedures versus (Updated) Existing Ones .....	187
ii.	Judicial versus Political Procedures.....	188
iii.	Ex ante versus Ex post Procedures .....	188
iv.	Avoiding Semblance of Change .....	189
B.	Legal Procedures.....	189
i.	Systemic Infringement Procedure.....	189
ii.	ECJ Involvement via EU Citizenship Rights.....	190
C.	Political Procedures.....	191
i.	Learning from the Council of Europe .....	191
ii.	Using Existing EU Bodies .....	192
iii.	Creating a Special New EU Organ: The Copenhagen Commission.....	192

D.	Penalties and Sanctions.....	193
i.	Financial Sanctions.....	193
ii.	Ejecting a Non-compliant Member State from the Union .....	194
V.	Conclusions .....	194
<b>11.</b>	<b>The EU Rule of Law Framework.....</b>	<b>197</b>
	<i>Emmanuel Crabit and Nicolaas Bel</i>	
I.	Introduction .....	197
A.	The Concept of Rule of Law—A Common Understanding.....	198
II.	Why has the Commission Established the EU Rule of Law Framework? .....	198
A.	Infringement Proceedings .....	199
B.	The Mechanisms of Article 7 TEU .....	200
C.	The Need to Address Intermediate Situations.....	201
III.	What are the Conceptual Components of the EU Rule of Law Framework? .....	202
A.	The Objective of the EU Rule of Law Framework.....	202
B.	‘National Rule of Law Safeguards’.....	203
C.	‘Systemic Threat to the Rule of Law’.....	203
D.	‘Rule of Law Crisis’.....	204
E.	The Power of the Commission to Establish the Framework .....	204
IV.	How Will the EU Rule of Law Framework Function?.....	205
V.	Conclusions .....	206
<b>12.</b>	<b>Global Activities and Current Initiatives in the Union to Strengthen the Rule of Law—A State of Play.....</b>	<b>207</b>
	<i>Andreas J Kumin</i>	
I.	Introductory Remarks.....	207
II.	Global and Regional Activities.....	208
A.	Global Activities .....	208
B.	Regional Activities.....	211
III.	Current Initiatives in the European Union.....	212
A.	Problems and Shortcomings.....	212
B.	The Initiative of the Irish Presidency of the Council in 2013 .....	215
C.	The Initiative of ‘Four Member States’.....	216
D.	Approaches by the Other EU Institutions .....	217
<b>13.</b>	<b>Managing the Rule of Law in a Heterogeneous Context: A Fundamental Rights Perspective on Ways Forward.....</b>	<b>221</b>
	<i>Gabriel N Toggenburg and Jonas Grimheden</i>	
I.	How Much Heterogeneity can European Unity Afford? The Argument for Minimum Constitutional Cohesion .....	221

II.	How to Look at the Rule of Law Debate? The Argument for a Fundamental Rights Perspective.....	225
III.	How to Ensure a Rights-based Performance? The Argument for Fundamental Rights Indicators .....	227
IV.	How to Move Beyond Sanctions: The Argument for Leading by Example and Learning from Peers .....	230
V.	How to Make Fundamental Rights a 'Joined-up' Mission? The Argument for a Bottom-up Approach.....	233
VI.	How to Move the Value Debate from Extreme Scenarios to Day to Day Business? The Argument for a Strategic Framework .....	234
VII.	Who Does What? Addressing the 'Elephant in the Room' Through a Hybrid Approach with Supranational and Intergovernmental Elements .....	237

### **Part V: Institutional Implications of Implementing the Rule of Law in Europe**

<b>14.</b>	<b>The EU and Rule of Law—The Unavoidable Question of: Who Controls it? .....</b>	<b>243</b>
	<i>Gregor Schusterschitz</i>	
I.	Introduction .....	243
II.	Institutional Power Play in Organisations and in the EU .....	244
III.	The Prelude to the Rule of Law Mechanism—The Negotiations for the Fundamental Rights Agency .....	245
A.	The Role of the Agency in the Legislative Procedure .....	246
B.	Remit of the Agency—Question of National Country Situations.....	246
C.	Role of Council of Europe.....	247
D.	Relevance for Rule of Law Discussion .....	247
IV.	Institutional Considerations behind the Rule of Law in the EU .....	247
A.	European Commission .....	248
B.	European Parliament .....	249
C.	Council .....	250
D.	Comparison of the Concepts of the Three Principal EU Organs .....	252
V.	Conclusion .....	253
<b>15.</b>	<b>The Rule of Law in European Policy: A Parliamentarian's View .....</b>	<b>255</b>
	<i>Eva Lichtenberger</i>	
I.	Introduction .....	255
II.	The Rule of Law in Neighbourhood Policy and External Action .....	255
A.	Neighbourhood-policy: Western Balkans.....	256
B.	Mexico .....	256

III.	The Rule of Law Within the Borders of the EU.....	257
A.	The Need for an Administrative Law for the European Institutions .....	258
B.	The Case of Hungary: The Article 7 Dilemma .....	259
C.	The Future of Article 7 TEU .....	262
<b>16.</b>	<b>The Rule of Law and the Constitutionalisation of the European Union .....</b>	<b>265</b>
	<i>Monica Claes and Matteo Bonelli</i>	
I.	Introduction .....	265
II.	Rule of Law, the Concept and the European Union.....	266
III.	Rule of Law and the Process of the Constitutionalisation of the European Union .....	269
A.	The Rule of EU Law .....	270
B.	The Rule of Law at the EU Level .....	271
C.	The Rule of Law in the Member States .....	274
IV.	Enforcing the Rule of Law in the EU Member States: the Dilemma .....	279
V.	The Responsibility to Guarantee the Rule of Law in the Member States: from Institutional Struggle to Institutional Cooperation? .....	282
VI.	The Way Forward?.....	288
	<i>Index .....</i>	<i>291</i>