

The Rule of Law in the European Union

The Internal Dimension

Theodore Konstadinides



• H A R T •
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2017

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi

Introduction	1
I. Contents of the Book.....	11

Part I: Design

1. Foundations of the EU Rule of Law	15
I. The EU as a System where Laws are Applied and Enforced	15
A. Institutional Understandings of the EU Rule of Law	15
i. The European Judges' Understanding of the Rule of Law.....	16
ii. The EU Political Institutions' Understanding of the Rule of Law	18
B. The Addressees of the EU Rule of Law.....	22
C. An EU Rule of Law as Opposed to a National Rule of Law.....	25
II. Arguments Against the EU Rule of Law	30
A. The Competence-creep Argument	30
B. The Crisis Resilience Argument.....	33
III. The Rule of Law as a Stretch Concept	38
2. Conceptualising the EU Rule of Law	45
I. Introduction.....	45
II. The Rule of Law, Not the Rule of Man	46
A. The Rule of Law as a Restraint on Arbitrary Power.....	47
i. Background History	47
ii. The EU against Arbitrary Exercise of Power	52
B. Conceptions on What the Rule of Law is	55
i. Background to the 'Thin-Thick' Dichotomy	55
ii. The Thin-Thick Dichotomy Relevance to the EU Rule of Law	58
III. The Rule of Law, Not the Rule of One State.....	61
A. The International Rule of Law as the Rule of Global Standards.....	61
B. The EU Rule of Law as the Rule of Common Values	65
IV. Conclusion	70

3. Locating the EU Rule of Law	72
I. Introduction.....	72
II. Express Commitment to the Rule of Law in EU Primary Law.....	74
A. The Internal Dimension of the EU Rule of Law: Self-proclamation.....	74
B. The External Dimension of the Rule of Law: Value Promotion.....	76
C. The Human Rights Dimension of the Rule of Law: Polity Building.....	80
III. Implied Commitment to the Rule of Law in EU Constitutional Principles.....	85
A. The Principle of Sincere Cooperation and its Progeny	86
B. The Principles of Consistency, Legitimate Expectations and Legal Certainty	91
C. The Principle of Legality	95
D. The Principle of Proportionality	98
IV. Conclusion	101

Part II: Enforcement

4. Holding EU Institutions to the Rule of Law	105
I. Introduction.....	105
II. Judicial Review of EU Acts as a Means of Individual Protection	107
III. Judicial Protection before EU Courts	111
A. Background.....	111
B. Direct Challenges.....	113
i. Review of Legality of EU Acts and Access to Justice	113
ii. Challenging Regulatory Acts and Direct Access to European Courts	116
C. Indirect Challenges.....	120
i. Effectiveness and the Substitutive Reliance on Requests for a Preliminary Ruling.....	120
IV. Judicial Protection before National Courts.....	124
A. Background.....	124
i. A Judicial Process Capable of Applying the Relevant EU Legislation.....	126
ii. Judicial Proceedings shall be Fair, Equitable, Timely and not Prohibitively Expensive.....	132
V. Review of EU Law by National Courts	133
VI. Conclusion	135
5. Holding Member States to the Rule of Law	139
I. Introduction.....	139
II. Coining the Term ‘Rule-of-Law Crises’.....	141

III.	Three Rule-of-Law Crises.....	146
A.	The Conflation of the Rule of Law with Security.....	146
B.	Crackdown on Judicial Independence and the Rule of Law	149
C.	Conduct of External Relations in Breach of Fundamental Rights.....	151
IV.	Rule-of-Law Enforcement Mechanisms in the Treaty	153
A.	Exploring the Possibility of Member State Liability Under Article 2 TEU.....	153
B.	The Public Enforcement ‘Infringement’ Procedure.....	159
C.	The Political Sanction Mechanism Under Article 7 TEU	161
V.	Conclusion	166
	Conclusion.....	169
	<i>Index</i>	<i>175</i>