

Unbelievable Errors

An Error Theory About All
Normative Judgements

Bart Streumer

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

I. Normative Judgements and Properties	1
1. Normative Judgements and Properties	1
2. Different Views	4
3. Who Are 'We'?	6
4. Reading This Book	8
II. The Reduction Argument	9
5. The First Version of the Argument	9
6. Is (N) the Correct Criterion of Property Identity?	11
7. Leibniz's Law	19
8. Indispensability to Deliberation	22
9. Rejecting (S)	24
10. Objections to Predicate D*	26
11. Preview	29
III. Further Versions of the Reduction Argument	30
12. A Second and Third Version of the Argument	30
13. Does the Argument Apply to Normative Relations?	36
14. Rampant Reductionism	38
15. Why Non-Reductive Realists May Remain Unmoved	40
16. Conclusion	41
IV. The False Guarantee and Regress Objections	42
17. An Implication of Reductive Realism	42
18. What Makes It the Case That a Certain Normative Predicate Ascribes a Certain Descriptive Property?	43
19. Descriptively Specified Conditions	44
20. The False Guarantee Objection	47
21. What the False Guarantee Objection Shows	53
22. Normatively Specified Conditions and the Regress Objection	55
23. Can Reductive Realists Appeal to the Correct First-Order Normative View?	58
24. Why Reductive Realism Is False	60
25. Preview	61
V. Further Defences of Realism	62
26. Underspecified Descriptive Predicates	62
27. Can Reductive Realists Appeal to the Reduction Argument?	63

28. Can Non-Reductive Realists Appeal to the False Guarantee and Regress Objections?	65
29. Can Reductive Realists Say That the Difference Between Normative and Descriptive Properties is a Difference in the Nature of These Properties?	65
30. Conclusion	68
VI. The Symmetry Objection	69
31. Cognitivism and Non-Cognitivism	69
32. Asymmetry	71
33. Quasi-Realist Explanations	72
34. Disappearing Quasi-Realism	77
35. Hybrid Explanations	81
36. Can Non-Cognitivists Appeal to the Reduction Argument?	84
37. Non-Cognitivism and the Error Theory	86
38. Revisionary Views	91
39. Preview	91
VII. Further Views	92
40. Cognitivist Expressivism	92
41. Descriptive Fictionalism	92
42. Constructivism	94
43. Constitutivism	97
44. Quietism	99
45. What Makes a Judgement or Property Normative?	101
46. Conclusion	103
VIII. The Error Theory	105
47. Which Properties Are Normative?	105
48. Which Beliefs Ascribe Normative Properties?	107
49. Judgements About Standards	109
50. Instrumental Normative Judgements	111
51. Judgements About Reasons for Belief	114
52. Moral Error Theories	118
53. What the Error Theory Entails	123
54. Can It Be True That All Normative Judgements Are False?	124
55. Conclusion	128
IX. Believing the Error Theory	129
56. My Inability to Believe the Error Theory	129
57. Why We Cannot Believe the Error Theory	132
58. Are There Counterexamples to (B4)?	138
59. Rationality and the Nature of Belief	145

60. Is There a Way in Which We Can Come to Believe the Error Theory?	146
61. Can We Believe That We Cannot Believe the Error Theory?	150
62. Why Our Inability to Believe the Error Theory Is Not a Problem for This Theory	150
63. Coming Close to Believing the Error Theory	152
64. Conclusion	154
X. Reason to Believe the Error Theory	155
65. Reasons and Ability	156
66. The Argument from Crazy Reasons	157
67. The Argument from Tables and Chairs	160
68. The Argument from Deliberation	162
69. Are There Counterexamples to (R)?	163
70. Extending the Arguments to Reasons for Belief	168
71. Conclusion	169
XI. Objections, Rejection, Revision	170
72. Objections to the Error Theory	170
73. Rejecting My Arguments	180
74. Revisionary Alternatives to the Error Theory	185
75. Conclusion	188
XII. Effects, Parallels, Progress	189
76. The Effects of Coming Close to Believing the Error Theory	189
77. Parallels in Other Areas of Philosophy	191
78. Reflective Equilibrium	196
79. Progress	199
Conclusion	200
<i>Bibliography</i>	203
<i>Index</i>	219