

EUCOTAX Series on European Taxation

The Principle of Equality in European Taxation

Editor

Gerard TK Meussen



 **KLUWER LAW
INTERNATIONAL**
THE HAGUE - LONDON - BOSTON

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xi
<i>About the Authors and Editors</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Treaties and Constitutions</i>	xxvii
 1. General Introduction	 1
<i>Hans Gribnau</i>	
1. Introduction	1
2. Taxation and equality in a historical perspective	3
3. The rule of law	6
4. Democracy	8
5. Constitutional democracy	10
6. The rule of legislature?	12
7. The changing position of the law	14
8. The judiciary comes to the rescue	18
9. A value-oriented theory of law	20
10. Principles as the normative core of law	21
11. Checks and balances in law making	23
12. Balancing powers and principles	25
13. From theory to practice	26
14. The principle of equality in constitutions and international treaties	27
15. Constitution or international treaty?	29
16. The equality principle as methodological instrument	31
17. Conclusion	32
 2. Austria	 35
<i>Karl Korinek and Michael Holoubek</i>	
1. Introduction	35
2. The development of the Constitutional Court's rulings on the principle of equality	36
3. "Localising a violation" of the principle of equality	41
4. Procedure for reviewing laws as to their compliance with the principle of equality	43
4.1 Establishing a "discrimination"	43
4.2 Review of "objective justification"	44
4.2.1 Existence of a "reasonable ground"	44

The Principle of Equality in European Taxation

4.2.2	The principle of proportionality	47
5.	Conclusion	49
3.	Belgium	51
	<i>Stefaan van Crombrugge</i>	
1.	Introduction	51
2.	The influence of Article 14 of the ECHR and Article 26 of the ICCPR on Belgian law	53
3.	The determination of categories of persons	54
3.1	The introduction of a specific tax	55
3.1.1	Non-recurrent contribution borne by companies	56
3.1.2	Flemish levy on discharging cooling water	57
3.1.3	Brussels levy on immovable property	57
3.1.4	Levy borne by chemists	58
3.1.5	Anti-pollution taxes	58
3.2	Differentiation within one and the same tax	59
3.2.1	Objective criterion	60
3.2.2	Reasonable justification	60
4.	The role of the comparability investigation	66
4.1	Incomparability to justify differentiation	68
4.2	Homogeneity of the categories	69
4.3	Proportionality	70
5.	Determining proportionality	71
6.	Conclusion	72
4.	France	75
	<i>Philippe Marchessou</i>	
1.	Introduction	75
2.	A time-honoured assertion of the principle of equality in the constitutional texts	75
2.1	The affirmation of the principle of equality in the French constitutional texts	76
2.2	The affirmation of the principle of equality in tax matters in the French constitutional texts	76
3.	The protection of the principle of equality in tax matters as guaranteed by the Conseil constitutionnel and the Conseil d'Etat	77
3.1	The Conseil constitutionnel as censor of the tax statute	77
3.2	The scope of the principle of equality	78
3.2.1	Equality before the law	78
3.2.2	Equality concerning public expenses	79
3.2.3	Equality in tax matters	79
3.2.4	Equality between taxpayers	81

Contents

3.3 The possibility of discrimination justified by the need to fight tax evasion	82
4. The Conseil d'Etat: a censor of the regulations	82
4.1 Moderate use of the principle of equality	83
4.2 Beyond an isolated appraisal of each tax	84
5. The possibility for a taxpayer to invoke the equality principle in his or her tax trial	85
5.1 Adjustment proceeding from a discriminatory interpretation of the law	85
5.2 Adjustment as the end-product of a discriminatory tax law	87
6. Conclusion	88
5. Germany	89
<i>Klaus Vogel and Christian Waldhoff</i>	
1. Introduction	89
2. Federal Constitutional Court decisions on tax equality	90
2.1 Ruling on the joint assessment of spouses	91
2.2 Ruling on tax deduction for a contribution to a political party	92
2.3 Ruling on the mutual effect of child support payments and fiscal capability	96
2.4 Ruling on the basic tax-free allowance	97
2.5 Ruling on taxation according to assessed value in net-wealth tax	98
3. Constitutional taxation equality as encumbrance according to the ability to pay	99
3.1 The four roots of the principle of ability to pay in the Basic Law	100
3.2 Application of the principle of the ability to pay	106
3.3 The problem of equality in the constitutionality of taxation law	109
3.4 The expression of tax fairness	110
4. Conclusion	114
6. Italy	115
<i>Adriano Di Pietro</i>	
1. The principle of equality in the tax field	115
2. The principle of non-discrimination in tax law	118
3. The non-discrimination principle in tax law: the case law of the Corte Costituzionale	120
4. Conclusion	123

7. The Netherlands	125
<i>Richard Happé</i>	
1. Introduction	125
2. The principle of equality and testing of Acts of Parliament	126
2.1 The principle of equality: a fundamental principle in the Dutch legal order	127
2.2 Article 26 of the ICCPR	130
2.3 Restricted meaning of Article 14 of the ECHR for Dutch tax law	131
3. The Supreme Court's method of judicial interpretation in judging an alleged violation of the principle of equality	134
3.1 Unequal treatment of similar cases	134
3.1.1 Brief sketch of the Dentist's Wife case	136
3.1.2 Legislator's margin of appreciation	137
3.1.3 First requirement: unequal treatment of equal cases	138
3.1.4 Second requirement: the absence of a reasonable and objective ground for unequal treatment	139
3.2 Unequal treatment of unequal cases	142
3.3 Indirect discrimination	143
4. The Supreme Court's task with respect to the unjustified unequal treatment of equal cases	144
4.1 The Court does not apply the statutory regulation	145
4.2 The Court applies the statutory regulation in conformity with the treaty	146
4.3 The Court does not do anything, because a choice has to be made that goes beyond its task of developing the law	147
4.4 A special case of relatively direct effect: the Court leaves the violation of the principle of equality undecided	149
5. An assessment of 10 years of case law on the basis of the principle of equality	151
6. Conclusion	154
8. Spain	157
<i>Tulio Rosembuj</i>	
1. Introduction	157
2. Constitutional doctrine	158
2.1 The power to levy taxes	158
2.2 Equality in the application of the law	159
2.3 Protection of equality	160
2.4 The principle of progressiveness	161
3. Conclusions	163

Contents

9. United Kingdom	165
<i>Philip Baker</i>	
Conclusion	169
<i>Gerard Meussen</i>	
1. Written constitution and the principle of equality	169
2. The constitutional courts in Europe	169
3. Absence of a constitutional court in the Netherlands and the United Kingdom	170
4. A constitutional principle of equality	171
5. European Court of Human Rights case law	172
6. Application of the principle of equality in taxation	173
7. Conclusion	174
 <i>Appendix I: Survey of Treaties and Constitutions</i>	 175
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	175
European Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	176
Constitutions:	
Austria	177
Belgium	177
France	178
Germany	181
Italy	187
The Netherlands	187
Spain	188
 <i>Appendix II: Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights</i>	 191
Tyrer	191
Gillow	203
Inze	224
Darby	239
Hentrich v. France	247
Karlheinz Schmidt v. Germany	265
 <i>Index</i>	 273