

# Time and Tax

## Issues in International, EU, and Constitutional Law

Edited by

Werner Haslehner

Georg Kofler

Alexander Rust



# Summary of Contents

Editors	v
Contributors	vii
Preface	xix
CHAPTER 1 Time and Distributive Rules in Tax Treaties <i>Georg Kofler &amp; Alexander Rust</i>	1
CHAPTER 2 Temporal Aspects of Passive Income under DTCs: Some Examples Based on Dutch Case Law <i>Daniël Smit</i>	13
CHAPTER 3 Double Tax Relief and Time <i>Joanna Wheeler</i>	27
CHAPTER 4 Timing Issues in the Application of Tax Treaties: Changes in the Applicable Treaty Law <i>Mario Tenore</i>	45
CHAPTER 5 Timing Disadvantages and Tax Treaty Non-discrimination <i>Niels Bammens</i>	59
CHAPTER 6 Value of Precedents in EU Direct Tax Law <i>Ieva Freija-Peccati</i>	77

## Summary of Contents

---

CHAPTER 7	
Temporal Aspects of CJEU Judgments Related to Tax Matters	
<i>F. Alfredo García Prats</i>	107
CHAPTER 8	
Tax Deferral and Fundamental Freedoms: Exit Tax, Foreign Losses, and Withholding Tax	
<i>Karoline Spies</i>	145
CHAPTER 9	
Tax Rules with Retroactive Effect Versus Legal Certainty and Legitimate Expectations	
<i>Dennis Weber</i>	169
CHAPTER 10	
Tax, Time, and the Merger Directive	
<i>Frederik Boulogne</i>	183
CHAPTER 11	
The Temporal Application of State Aid Rules to Domestic Tax Measures: A Sensitive Matter	
<i>Alice Pirlot &amp; Edoardo Traversa</i>	197
CHAPTER 12	
Effective Legal Remedies and Fair Trial in Tax and Time	
<i>Katerina Pantazatou</i>	213
CHAPTER 13	
The Constitutional Limits of Retroactivity in Tax Law	
<i>Serge Schroeder</i>	239
CHAPTER 14	
Time and Tax: Constitutional Versus Economic Perspectives	
<i>Werner Haslehner</i>	271
Index	295

## Table of Contents

---

	[1]	Introduction	16
	[2]	Emigration	16
	[3]	Privatization	17
	[C]	Dividend Income	18
	[1]	Introduction	18
	[2]	Treaty Shopping	18
	[3]	Emigration	19
	[4]	Loss of Tax-Treaty Residence Status	20
§2.04		Capital Gains	21
§2.05		Interest and Royalty Income	21
§2.06		Business Profits	23
	[A]	Introduction	23
	[B]	Emigration	23
§2.07		Relief from Double Taxation	24
§2.08		Final Remarks	26
CHAPTER 3			
Double Tax Relief and Time			
		<i>Joanna Wheeler</i>	27
§3.01		Introduction	27
	[A]	Scope of This Chapter	27
	[B]	Income Taxation	27
§3.02		Double Tax Relief for Income	28
§3.03		Taxable Events	29
	[A]	Mismatches of Taxable Events	29
	[B]	Consequential Mismatches	30
§3.04		Tax on Profit	31
	[A]	Division of Profit into Annual Amounts	31
	[B]	Losses	31
§3.05		Timing of Receipts and Expenses	33
	[A]	Allocation of Profit over Time	33
	[B]	Timing Differences and Withholding Taxes	33
§3.06		Inflation Gains	34
§3.07		Currency Exchange Issues	35
	[A]	Payments Subject to Withholding Tax	35
	[B]	PE Profit and Currency Issues	36
	[C]	Geographical Source of Exchange Rate Gains and Losses	36
§3.08		Tax Treaties	37
	[A]	Treaty Obligation to Grant DTR	37
	[B]	Timing of the Tax Charge under Treaties	39
	[C]	Assigning a Time to Income for Treaty Purposes	39
	[1]	Active Income	40
	[2]	Passive Income	40
	[D]	Start and End of Treaty	41

	[1]	Different Starting and Ending Dates	42
	[2]	Replacement of a Treaty	42
§3.09		Conclusion	43
CHAPTER 4			
Timing Issues in the Application of Tax Treaties: Changes in the Applicable Treaty Law			
		<i>Mario Tenore</i>	45
§4.01		Introductory Remarks	45
§4.02		Rules Addressing Entry Into Force and Termination in the OECD Model	46
	[A]	General Remarks	46
		[1] Article 31 OECD Model	47
		[2] Article 32 OECD Model	49
		[3] Rules Addressing the Succession of Tax Treaties	49
	[B]	Selected Issues Related to the Interpretation of Temporal Rules in the OECD Model	51
		[1] Timing Issues Arising from Differences in Domestic Laws of the Contracting States	51
		[2] Timing Issues Arising from Distributive Rules	53
		[3] Timing Issues Arising from Procedural Rules	56
CHAPTER 5			
Timing Disadvantages and Tax Treaty Non-discrimination			
		<i>Niels Bammens</i>	59
§5.01		Introduction	59
§5.02		Reported Case Law	60
	[A]	Early Burdens	60
		[1] Taxation at Source	60
		[2] Prepayment of Tax	62
		[3] Procedural Early Burdens	64
	[B]	Late Benefits	65
		[1] Deductibility of Expenses	65
		[2] Timing Issues in Relation to Loss Set-Off	67
§5.03		The Scope of Application of the Different Paragraphs of OECD Model Article 24	70
§5.04		Conclusions and Remedies	72
CHAPTER 6			
Value of Precedents in EU Direct Tax Law			
		<i>Ieva Freija-Peccati</i>	77
§6.01		The Role of the CJEU in Shaping EU Direct Tax Law	77
	[A]	CJEU Action in Direct Tax Law	77

## Table of Contents

---

	[B]	Challenges in the Field of Direct Taxation	79
§6.02		Reasoning Using Prior Decisions	81
	[A]	Reliance on Prior Decisions	81
		[1] Legitimation	81
		[2] Techniques	82
		[3] Following Schumacker's Tracks	84
		[a] <i>Schumacker</i> Itself	84
		[b] <i>Wielockx and Asscher</i>	86
		[c] <i>Wallentin, Commission v Estonia, Kieback and X</i>	88
		[d] <i>D, Turpeinen, Lakebrink, and Others</i>	90
		[e] Other Lines of Case Law Arising out of <i>Schumacker: Manninen and ACT GL</i>	91
	[B]	Departures from Prior Judgments	92
		[1] Reasons for Departing from Prior Decisions	93
		[2] Techniques for Moving Away from Existing Case Law	95
		[a] Express Overruling	95
		[b] Soft Overrulings	95
		[c] Distinguishing Cases	101
§6.03		Conclusion	104
CHAPTER 7			
Temporal Aspects of CJEU Judgments Related to Tax Matters			
		<i>F. Alfredo García Prats</i>	107
§7.01		Introduction	107
§7.02		Effects of the Interpretation Role of the CJEU and Consequences in Tax Matters	110
	[A]	<i>Ex Tunc</i> Effects: Implications	113
		[1] The Moment the EU Law Came into Force	113
		[2] <i>Ex Tunc</i> Effects and Changes in Interpretation	113
		[3] <i>Ex Tunc</i> Interpretation of Charges and Benefits	114
		[4] <i>Ex Tunc</i> Interpretation of EU Principles of Law	115
	[B]	Legal Consequences for Domestic Courts: Applying Preliminary Rulings <i>Ex Tunc</i>	117
§7.03		The Exception Rule	120
	[A]	The Starting Point: The TFEU's Lack of Recognition Versus the CJEU's Expansion	120
	[B]	Consolidating the Exception Rule: Applying It to Tax Matters	122
		[1] Elements of the Exception Rule	123
		[a] Exclusive Competence	123

	[b]	Single Declaration of the Limitation: Identifying the First Case	125
	[c]	Consideration <i>Ex Petitem</i> : Not <i>Ex Officio</i>	127
	[d]	Good Faith of Those Concerned and Risk of Serious Difficulties	130
	[2]	The Exception Rule: Application in Tax and Other Matters	136
§7.04		Consequences of a Temporal-Effects Limitation	141
CHAPTER 8			
Tax Deferral and Fundamental Freedoms: Exit Tax, Foreign Losses, and Withholding Tax			
		<i>Karoline Spies</i>	145
§8.01		About This Chapter	145
§8.02		Tax Deferral and the Non-discrimination Test	145
	[A]	Evaluation	145
	[B]	The Approach by the CJEU	148
§8.03		Exit Taxes	149
	[A]	The Two Potential Discriminations and Their Justifications	149
	[B]	CJEU Case Law: From Tax Deferral Until Realization to Staggered Payments	151
		[1] First Phase: Strict Proportionality Test	151
		[2] Second Phase: Lenient Proportionality Test	151
		[3] Third Phase: Overruling the First Line of Cases	153
	[C]	Reasons for Accepting the Cash-Flow Disadvantage	154
§8.04		Foreign Losses	155
	[A]	The Two Discrimination Issues and Their Justifications	155
	[B]	CJEU Case Law: No Need for a Deduction-Recapture Rule	157
	[C]	Reasons for Accepting the Cash-Flow Disadvantage	159
§8.05		Withholding Tax	161
	[A]	The Two Types of Discrimination and Their Justifications	161
	[B]	CJEU Case Law: No Tax Deferral	162
	[C]	Reasons for Accepting the Cash-Flow Disadvantage	163
§8.06		Conclusion	165
CHAPTER 9			
Tax Rules with Retroactive Effect Versus Legal Certainty and Legitimate Expectations			
		<i>Dennis Weber</i>	169
§9.01		Introduction	169
§9.02		Principle of the Protection of Legitimate Expectations	169
	[A]	General	169

## Table of Contents

---

	[B]	Only 'A Prudent and Circumspect Trader' May Invoke the Principle of the Protection of Legitimate Expectations	170
§9.03		EU and National Legislation with Retroactive Effect	172
	[A]	Substantive EU Rules with Retroactive Effect	172
	[B]	Procedural EU Rules with Retroactive Effect	173
	[C]	EU Case Law Concerning National Legislation with Retroactive Effect	173
	[D]	Legislation Immediately Entering into Force; Transitional Provisions on the Basis of the Principle of the Protection of Legitimate Expectations	176
§9.04		Conclusion	181
CHAPTER 10			
Tax, Time, and the Merger Directive			
<i>Frederik Boulogne</i>			
			183
§10.01		Introduction	183
§10.02		Qualification under Article 2 MD: <i>Kofoed</i>	184
§10.03		Tax Avoidance: Minimum Holding Period	186
§10.04		Double Taxation: <i>3D I Srl</i>	189
§10.05		Safeguarding the Financial Interests of the Member States and Taxation of Gains: <i>Marc Lassus</i>	190
§10.06		Conclusion	195
CHAPTER 11			
The Temporal Application of State Aid Rules to Domestic Tax Measures: A Sensitive Matter			
<i>Alice Pirlot &amp; Edoardo Traversa</i>			
			197
§11.01		Introduction	197
§11.02		The Time Frame of EU State Aid Review	198
	[A]	General Overview	198
	[B]	Conflicts and Tensions with National Procedural Tax Rules	199
§11.03		Temporal Issues Raised by the Recovery of Aid	202
	[A]	The Consequences of the Passage of Time on the Calculation of the Aid to Be Recovered	202
	[B]	Legal Uncertainty and Recovery of Unlawful Aid	205
§11.04		The Objective of the Commission: Pursuing a New Tax Agenda?	209
§11.05		Conclusion	211
CHAPTER 12			
Effective Legal Remedies and Fair Trial in Tax and Time			
<i>Katerina Pantazatou</i>			
			213
§12.01		Introduction	213

§12.02	Timely Justice	214
	[A] The European Convention of Human Rights	215
	[1] The Right to a Fair Trial	215
	[2] The Right to an Effective Remedy	219
	[B] The Charter of Fundamental Rights	220
	[1] General Principles, the Charter, and the ECHR: The Right of the Defence	222
§12.03	Limitation Periods	225
	[A] Safeguards: Procedural Autonomy	227
	[1] Claims Based on Improper or Non-timely Implementation of a Directive	228
	[2] Principle of Equivalence	229
	[3] Res Judicata	230
	[4] Principle of Effectiveness	232
	[5] 'Reasonable Time': An Unambiguous Concept?	235
	[6] Commencement	237
§12.04	Conclusion	238
CHAPTER 13		
The Constitutional Limits of Retroactivity in Tax Law		
<i>Serge Schroeder</i>		239
§13.01	The Classic Distinction at the Heart of Retroactivity	239
§13.02	Juridical Retroactivity	241
	[A] The Value of the Principle of Non-retroactivity in Luxembourg	241
	[1] The Relevant Texts	241
	[2] Other Sources of Law	242
	[3] Sanction Mechanisms	246
	[B] Looking Outside Luxembourg's Borders	249
	[1] The Situation in Belgium	249
	[2] The Situation in Germany	254
	[C] Conclusions for Luxembourg	258
§13.03	Economic Retroactivity	260
	[A] An Iterative Look Beyond Luxembourg's Borders	260
	[1] Legislative Freedom in Belgium	260
	[2] A Restricted Framework in Germany	262
	[3] Conclusions on Economic Retroactivity for Luxembourg	264
§13.04	Retrospectivity of Tax Law	266
§13.05	Conclusion	269

## Table of Contents

---

### CHAPTER 14

#### Time and Tax: Constitutional Versus Economic Perspectives

*Werner Haslechner*

271

§14.01	Introduction	271
§14.02	Elements of Taxation Timing	272
	[A] Substantive Rules: When to Impose Tax	272
	[B] Procedural Rules: When to Collect Tax	273
	[C] Transition Rules: The Effect of Rule Changes	273
§14.03	The Constitutional Perspective(s) on Taxation Timing	274
	[A] Equal Treatment and the Ability-to-Pay Principle	274
	[B] The Rule of Law and Right to Property: Limits on Retroactive Taxation	278
	[C] Legal Certainty, Reliance, and Protection of Legitimate Expectations: Limits to Retrospective Taxation and the Need for Transition Relief	283
§14.04	Law and Economics Perspective(s) and Tools	284
	[A] Societal Welfare Versus Public Choice Theory	284
	[B] Efficiency Versus Equity	286
	[C] Incentives, Indirect Effects, and Incidence	287
§14.05	Economics Perspectives on Taxation Timing	288
	[A] When to Impose Tax: The 'Right' Tax Base and Timing of 'Realization'	288
	[B] When to Collect Tax: A Proposal for Retrospective Taxation	290
	[C] Transition Rules: The Case Against Relief	292
§14.06	Conclusion	293
Index		295