

# Double (Non-)Taxation and EU Law

Christoph Marchgraber

 Wolters Kluwer

# Table of Contents

Preface	ix
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	xi
CHAPTER 1	
Double (Non-)Taxation: Two Legal Phenomena	1
1 Political and Economic Background	1
2 The Phenomena of Double Taxation and Double Non-Taxation from an EU Law Perspective	7
2.1 BEPS, Double Non-Taxation and EU Law	7
2.2 The Phenomenon of Double Taxation from an EU Law Perspective	14
2.3 The Phenomenon of Double Non-Taxation from an EU Law Perspective	22
3 The Fundamental Freedoms and the State Aid Rules as Legal Means to Tackle Double Taxation and Double Non-Taxation	25
CHAPTER 2	
Double (Non-)Taxation and EU Tax Policy	31
1 Double (Non-)Taxation and the Member States' Direct Tax Systems	31
1.1 Changes in EU Direct Tax Policy	31
1.2 Double Taxation in the Tax Policy Debate on Direct Taxes	41
1.2.1 Juridical Double Taxation	41
1.2.2 Economic Double Taxation	44
1.3 Double Non-Taxation in the Tax Policy Debate on Direct Taxes	49
1.3.1 Double Non-Taxation and Exit Taxation	49
1.3.2 The Code of Conduct Group's Work on Cross-Border Tax Arbitrage	51
1.3.3 The European Commission's Work on Double Non-Taxation	53
2 Double (Non-)Taxation and the European VAT System	57

## Table of Contents

---

2.1	The Continuing Development of the European VAT System	57
2.2	Double (Non-)Taxation in the European VAT System	60
CHAPTER 3		
The EU Primary Law Framework in Tax Matters		65
1	The Legal Concept of the Internal Market	65
1.1	Free Movement and Undistorted Competition as Characteristics of the Internal Market Concept	65
1.2	The Legal Means to Implement the Internal Market Concept	68
2	The Scope of Protection of the Fundamental Freedoms	71
2.1	The Relevance of the Fundamental Freedoms in Tax Law	71
2.2	The Convergence and the Limits of Applying the Fundamental Freedoms	75
2.3	The Different Kinds of Obstacles to Free Movement	88
2.3.1	The Discrimination of Cross-Border Economic Transactions	88
2.3.2	The Restriction of Cross-Border Economic Transactions	94
2.3.2.1	“Double Burdens” and “Double Hurdles”	94
2.3.2.2	“Neutral Rules” and “Even-Handed Rules”	100
2.3.3	The Impediments for Free Movement Resulting from Disparities	104
2.4	Comparability	108
2.4.1	The Function of the Comparability Analysis in the ECJ’s Tax Jurisprudence	108
2.4.2	The Spectrum of Comparability	119
2.4.3	The Influence of the Legal Situation in Other Member States	130
2.5	Justification Grounds	136
2.5.1	Written and Unwritten Justification Grounds	136
2.5.2	Justification Grounds in the ECJ’s Tax Jurisprudence	138
2.5.3	The Blurred Boundaries Between the Principle of Territoriality, the Balanced Allocation of Taxing Powers and the Concept of Fiscal Cohesion	142
2.6	Proportionality	155
3	The Scope of Protection of the State Aid Provisions	160
3.1	The Relevance of the State Aid Provisions in Tax Law	160
3.2	Tax Benefits as Obstacles to Undistorted Competition	169
3.2.1	Aid in Any Form Whatsoever	169
3.2.2	Granting by a Member State or Through State Resources	172
3.2.3	Distortions of Competition and Adverse Effects on Trade Between Member States	175
3.3	Comparability	178
3.3.1	Different Treatment	178
3.3.2	Preferential Treatment	191

	3.3.3	Selective Treatment	195
3.4		Exceptions and Justification Grounds	200
	3.4.1	<i>De Jure</i> Exceptions and Discretionary Exceptions	200
	3.4.2	Justification by Means of the Mechanisms Inherent in the Tax System	202
	3.4.3	Justification by Means of Objectives Extrinsic to the Tax System	204
3.5		Proportionality	209
4		The Convergence of the ECJ's Approaches with Regard to the Fundamental Freedoms and the State Aid Provisions	211
CHAPTER 4			
The Impact of EU Law on Double (Non-)Taxation			223
1		Double Taxation in the Light of EU Law	223
	1.1	The Challenge of Tackling Double Taxation by Means of Primary EU Law	223
	1.2	Double Taxation and Positive Integration	227
	1.2.1	Secondary EU Law as a Tool to Legally Enforce the Primary EU Law's Aim of Avoiding Double Taxation	227
	1.2.2	The Lindfors Decision: Has the ECJ Changed Its Position on Double Taxation with Regard to Non-harmonized Taxes?	232
	1.3	Double Taxation and the Fundamental Freedoms	235
	1.3.1	Juridical Double Taxation	235
	1.3.1.1	The ECJ's Dilemma and Suggested Solutions	235
	1.3.1.2	Tax Treaty Override, Juridical Double Taxation and Primary EU Law	250
	1.3.1.3	The Fundamental Freedom's Impact on Double Taxation Conventions	261
	1.3.1.4	The Compensation for Discriminatory Effects by Means of a Double Taxation Convention	271
	1.3.2	Economic Double Taxation	278
	1.3.2.1	The (Apparent) Resemblance of Economic and Juridical Double Taxation from an EU Law Perspective	278
	1.3.2.2	The Obligation of the Shareholder's Member State of Residence to Avoid Bilaterally-Caused Economic Double Taxation	280
	1.3.2.3	The Obligation of the Distributing Company's Member State of Residence to Avoid Unilaterally-Caused Economic Double Taxation	290
	1.3.2.4	The Avoidance of Double Non-Taxation Through Linking the Member States' (Dividend) Taxation Systems	294

## Table of Contents

---

1.4	Double Taxation and the Limits of the Fundamental Freedoms	304
2	Double Non-Taxation in the Light of EU Law	313
2.1	The Challenge of Tackling Double Non-Taxation by Means of Primary EU Law	313
2.2	Double Non-Taxation and Positive Integration	318
2.2.1	Specific Provisions Aimed at Avoiding Double Non-Taxation	318
2.2.1.1	Double Non-Taxation and the VAT Directive	318
2.2.1.2	Double Non-Taxation and the Parent-Subsidiary Directive	324
2.2.2	The Avoidance of Double (Non-)Taxation by Means of Secondary EU Law	333
2.3	Double Non-Taxation and the State Aid Rules	340
2.3.1	The Unilaterally-Directed Effect of the State Aid Rules	340
2.3.2	Thoughts on the State Aid Law Compatibility of Selected Measures Commonly Associated with Double Non-Taxation	344
2.3.2.1	Relief from Juridical Double Taxation and State Aid Law	344
2.3.2.2	Transfer Pricing Adjustments and State Aid Law	355
2.3.2.3	Participation Exemption Regimes and State Aid Law	367
2.4	Double Non-Taxation and the Limits of the State Aid Rules	371
CHAPTER 5		
Concluding and Summarizing Remarks		381
Bibliography		391
Index		441