

BRICS and International Tax Law

Peter Antony Wilson



Wolters Kluwer

Table of Contents

Preface	xiii
List of Abbreviations	xv
Acknowledgements	xxi
CHAPTER 1	
Introduction	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Birth of the BRICS	2
1.3 FDI	3
1.4 Political Cooperation	5
1.5 BRICS Tax Cooperation	6
1.6 Illicit Trade Flows	7
1.7 Tax Authority Capacity	9
1.8 Hypotheses, Assumptions and Questions	14
1.9 Research Methods	16
CHAPTER 2	
Core International Tax Policy and Law	19
2.1 Introduction	19
2.1.1 BRICS and Policy	19
2.1.1.1 Aid Agencies	19
2.1.1.2 Investment Treaties	21
2.1.1.3 WTO	23
2.1.2 OECD Model DTC: Core BRICS Policy and Law	25
2.1.2.1 OECD Model DTC	25
2.1.2.2 OECD Policy and the Prisoners' Dilemma	37
2.1.3 MNEs and Core Policy Influence	46
2.1.3.1 Industry and Trade Groups	46
2.1.3.2 Government Lobbying	48

Table of Contents

2.1.4	Significance of the Policy Influencers	48
2.1.5	Next Chapter	49
CHAPTER 3		
	Evasion and Avoidance According to the BRICS	51
3.1	Introduction	51
3.2	Special Focus	52
3.3	BRICS: Evasion	53
3.3.1	Introduction	53
3.3.2	Concealing Income	53
3.3.2.1	Purposely Not Paying Existing Liability	59
3.3.2.2	Wilful or Intentional Fraudulent Conduct	61
3.3.2.3	Significance: Criminal Conduct	64
3.4	BRICS: Avoidance	64
3.4.1	Introduction	64
3.4.2	Reducing Tax Liability	66
3.4.3	Loopholes and Intent	69
3.4.4	Substance Over Form	71
3.5	Meanings: Significance	76
3.6	BRICS Coordination: Avoidance	77
3.7	Divergences: Consequences	77
3.8	Mispriced Transactions and Tax Havens: Evasion or Avoidance	77
3.9	Next Chapter	77
CHAPTER 4		
	Countering Avoidance: SAARs	79
4.1	Introduction	79
4.2	Thin Capitalization	79
4.2.1	Exchange Controls	80
4.2.2	India and Thin Capitalization	81
4.2.3	Ratio or Arm's Length	82
4.2.4	Associates	85
4.2.5	Hybrids and Thin Capitalization	88
4.2.6	Lender's Residence	89
4.2.7	Safe Harbours	90
4.2.8	Exemptions	91
4.2.9	Excess Interest: Deemed Dividend	92
4.2.10	Treaty Override	93
4.2.11	Thin Capitalization: Anti-avoidance Rule?	95
4.2.12	Thin Capitalization and GAAR	95
4.2.13	BRICS DTCs: Affirmative Savings	96
4.2.14	BRICS and Coordination	96
4.2.15	Thin Capitalization: Significance of Widening the Rules	96
4.3	Transfer Pricing	97
4.3.1	Background	97

4.3.2	Associates	99
4.3.3	Transactions	100
4.3.4	CCAs	102
4.3.5	Excessive Leverage	103
4.3.6	Methods	103
4.3.7	Safe Harbours	108
4.3.8	Documentation	111
4.3.9	APA	113
4.3.10	Audit Selection	116
4.3.11	Burden of Proof	119
4.3.12	UN Transfer Pricing Manual	119
4.3.13	Compensatory Adjustments and Double Taxation	120
4.3.14	Transfer Pricing: BRICS Cooperation	123
4.3.15	BRICS: Significance of Widening of TP	123
4.4	CFC Rules	124
4.4.1	Background	124
4.4.2	Exchange Controls and OFDI	124
4.4.3	Evolution of the Rules	126
4.4.4	Control	128
4.4.5	Potentially Attributed Income	129
4.4.6	Substance	131
4.4.7	Exemptions	133
4.4.8	Notification	138
4.4.9	Tax Credits	140
4.4.10	BPA Override	141
	4.4.10.1 What Is the Argument?	141
	4.4.10.2 Treaties and Interpretation	142
	4.4.10.3 BRICS and BPA Override	142
4.4.11	CFCs: Anti-avoidance Rule?	145
4.4.12	CFCs and GAAR	146
4.4.13	CFCs: DTCs and BPA Override	146
4.4.14	BRICS: Cooperation and CFC Rules	147
4.4.15	Significance: Divergences from the Developed World	147
4.5	Next Chapter	148
CHAPTER 5		
	Information Exchange	149
5.1	Introduction	149
5.2	Exchanging Architecture	150
5.3	Exchanging Information	151
5.4	DTCs-Article 26	153
5.5	TIEAs	155
5.6	Multilateral Agreements	155
	5.6.1 Exchanging Prior Information	157
5.7	Financial Account Information	157

Table of Contents

5.7.1	BRICS and Peer Reviews	158
5.7.1.1	Global Forum: Roles of Influence	158
5.7.1.2	AEOI: Legal Basis for Exchange	159
5.7.1.3	AEOI: Procedures Facilitating Exchange	159
5.8	BRICS and Coordination	161
5.9	BRICS: Consequences of Exchanging	161
5.10	Next Chapter	162
CHAPTER 6		
	Countering Treaty Benefits	163
6.1	Introduction	163
6.2	Resident	163
6.2.1	Introduction	163
6.2.2	POEM	165
6.2.2.1	Highest Decision Making	166
6.2.2.2	Economic Activities	167
6.2.3	Residence and DTCs	167
6.2.4	BRICS: DTC Residence and POEM	169
6.2.5	Residence: Effectiveness in Denying DTC Benefits	171
6.3	Beneficial Ownership, Limitation of Benefits, Principal Purpose	171
6.3.1	Introduction	171
6.3.2	Beneficial Ownership	172
6.3.2.1	Contractual Obligations	173
6.3.2.2	Possession, Use, Risk and Control	176
6.3.3	BRICS: DTCs and Beneficial Ownership	179
6.3.4	Limitation of Benefits (LOB)	180
6.3.4.1	BRICS and LOBs	181
6.3.5	MPT	185
6.3.6	DTCs: LOB and MPTs	185
6.3.6.1	LOBs	186
6.3.6.2	MPT	187
6.3.6.3	Significance of LOB and MPT Approach	189
6.3.6.4	Coordination: LOB and MPT	189
6.3.7	Non-cooperative Countries and Indirect Transfers	189
6.3.7.1	Introduction	189
6.3.7.2	Non-cooperative Countries	190
6.3.7.3	Indirect Asset Transfers	190
6.3.7.4	Domestic Rule	191
6.3.7.5	Indirect Transfers and DTCs	194
6.3.8	BRICS and Coordination	195
6.3.9	Significance: Non-cooperative and Indirect Asset Transfers	196
6.4	Next Chapter	196

CHAPTER 7	
BEPS Final 2015 Reports	197
7.1 Introduction	197
7.2 Strengthening Anti-abuse Rules	199
7.2.1 Introduction	199
7.2.2 Domestic Actions	200
7.2.2.1 Hybrid Mismatches	200
7.2.2.2 CFC Rules	201
7.2.2.3 Interest Deductibility	202
7.2.2.4 Harmful Tax Practices	203
7.2.3 International Actions	205
7.2.3.1 Digital Economy	205
7.2.3.2 DTC Abuse	206
7.2.3.2.1 LOB	207
7.2.3.2.2 MPT	207
7.2.3.3 PEs	208
7.2.3.3.1 Commissionaire Agreements: Business Presence	208
7.2.3.3.2 Dependent Agency PEs	209
7.2.3.3.3 Excluded Activities	210
7.2.4 Value Creation Actions	210
7.2.4.1 Location Savings and Other Local Market Features	211
7.2.4.2 Assembled Workforces	212
7.2.4.3 MNE Group Synergies	212
7.2.4.4 Intangibles	212
7.2.4.4.1 Identification	212
7.2.4.4.2 DEMPE	213
7.2.4.4.3 Cost Contribution Agreements (CCA)	215
7.2.4.4.4 Intra-group Services	216
7.2.4.4.4.1 Benefits Test	217
7.2.4.4.4.2 Shareholder Activities and Duplication	217
7.2.4.4.4.3 Centralized Services	217
7.2.5 Information Gathering Actions	219
7.2.5.1 Disclosure of Aggressive Tax Planning	219
7.2.5.2 Country-by-Country (CbyC) Reporting	220
7.2.6 MAP and Mandatory and Binding Dispute Resolution	221
7.3 Multilateral Instrument ('MI') and the BRICS	223
7.3.1 Introduction	223
7.3.2 DTC Abuse	223
7.3.3 Binding MAP	223
7.3.4 Opt Out	224
7.4 Recommendations: BRICS Coordination	224
7.5 Next Chapter	225

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 8	
Dispute Resolution	227
8.1 Introduction	227
8.2 Arbitration	227
8.3 Investment Treaties	230
8.4 WTO	234
8.5 Human Rights	236
8.6 Human Rights Defence	238
8.7 Conclusion	239
CHAPTER 9	
BRICS and FDI: DTC Anti-abuse and Dispute Resolution	241
9.1 Introduction	241
9.2 DTC Anti-abuse	243
9.2.1 Application	243
9.2.2 Domestic Rules	245
9.2.2.1 Transfer Pricing	245
9.2.2.1.1 APA Programme	246
9.2.2.1.2 Safe Harbours	248
9.2.2.1.3 Country-by-Country Reporting	249
9.2.2.2 Thin Capitalization	250
9.2.2.2.1 ND Article Override	250
9.2.2.2.2 Arm's Length Lenders Resident in Tax Privileged Countries	251
9.2.2.3 Hybrid Debt	251
9.2.2.4 Residence	252
9.2.2.4.1 Place of Incorporation and POEM	252
9.2.2.4.2 POEM Tie-Breaker: Decision Makers' Location v. Economic Activities Location	253
9.2.2.5 Beneficial Ownership	254
9.2.2.5.1 DTCs: Contractual Control v. Economic Control	254
9.2.3 International Rules	255
9.2.3.1 Limitation of Benefits	255
9.2.3.1.1 BRICS and Treaty Shopping	256
9.2.3.1.2 BEPS Recommendation	257
9.2.3.2 Main Purpose Tests	257
9.2.3.2.1 BRICS and MPTs	257
9.2.3.2.2 BEPS Recommendation	258
9.2.3.3 Indirect Asset Transfers	259
9.2.3.3.1 Domestic Rules	259
9.2.3.3.2 BRICS and DTCs	260
9.2.3.3.3 BEPS Recommendation	260
9.2.3.4 Third Country PEs	261

9.2.3.4.1	Domestic Rules	261
9.2.3.4.2	BEPS Recommendation	261
9.2.3.5	DTCs and Business Purpose	262
9.2.3.6	DTC and Savings Provisions	263
9.2.3.6.1	BEPS Recommendation	263
9.2.3.6.2	BRICS and DTCs Savings Clauses	264
9.2.3.7	Contract Splitting	264
9.2.3.7.1	BRICS and Contract Splitting	265
9.2.3.7.2	BEPS Recommendation	265
9.2.3.8	Multilateral Instrument	266
9.2.3.8.1	Changes and Sovereignty	266
9.2.3.8.2	The Instrument	267
9.2.3.8.3	BRICS and the Instrument	267
9.3	Supplementary Dispute Resolution	269
9.3.1	MAP	269
9.3.1.1	MAP and BRICS Dispute Resolution	269
9.3.1.2	The MI and Sovereignty	270
9.3.1.3	BRICS, MAP and Sovereignty	271
9.3.2	Binding and Mandatory Arbitration	271
9.3.2.1	BEPS Recommendation	271
9.3.2.2	Arbitration Rules	273
9.3.3	Human Rights	274
9.4	Conclusion	275
CHAPTER 10		
Summary of Conclusions		277
10.1	Research Problems and Hypotheses	277
10.2	Tax Authority Capacity	277
10.3	Tax Coordination and Cooperation	278
10.4	International Tax Law	278
ANNEX		
Communiqué of BRICS, Heads of Revenue Meeting		283
Bibliography		287
Table of Cases		335
Index		345