

The OECD Multilateral Instrument for Tax Treaties

Analysis and Effects

Edited by

Michael Lang

Pasquale Pistone

Alexander Rust

Josef Schuch

Claus Staringer



Wolters Kluwer

Summary of Contents

Editors	v
Contributors	vii
Preface	xix
CHAPTER 1	
Scope of the Multilateral Instrument	
<i>Robin Damberger</i>	1
CHAPTER 2	
Interpretation of Terms Used in the Multilateral Instrument	
<i>Svetlana Wakounig</i>	21
CHAPTER 3	
The Relevance of the Conference of the Parties for the Interpretation and Amendment of the Multilateral Instrument	
<i>Raphael Holzinger</i>	43
CHAPTER 4	
Authentic Languages and Official Translations of the Multilateral Instrument and Covered Tax Agreements	
<i>Josef Schuch & Jean-Philippe Van West</i>	67
CHAPTER 5	
The Legal Relevance of the Minimum Standard in the OECD/BEPS Project	
<i>Andreas Langer</i>	89

Summary of Contents

CHAPTER 6	
The Relationship Between Tax Treaties and the Multilateral Instrument: Compatibility Clauses in the Multilateral Instrument	
<i>Sriram Govind & Pasquale Pistone</i>	111
CHAPTER 7	
Options under the Multilateral Instrument	
<i>Alexandra Miladinovic & Alexander Rust</i>	139
CHAPTER 8	
Reservations to the Multilateral Instrument	
<i>Benjamin Walker</i>	165
CHAPTER 9	
Notifications According to the Multilateral Instrument and Consolidated Versions of Tax Treaties	
<i>Christiane Zöhrer</i>	191
CHAPTER 10	
Consequences of Withdrawal from or Termination of the Multilateral Instrument	
<i>Benedikt Hörtenhuber</i>	211
CHAPTER 11	
Future Changes to Covered Tax Agreements and of the Multilateral Convention to Implement Tax Treaty-Related Measures to Prevent BEPS	
<i>Nathalie Bravo</i>	237
Index	265

Table of Contents

Editors	v
Contributors	vii
Preface	xix
CHAPTER 1	
Scope of the Multilateral Instrument <i>Robin Damberger</i>	1
1 Assessing the Scope of the Multilateral Instrument	1
2 The Scope of the Convention	2
2.1 The Framework of Articles 1 and 2 of the MLI	2
2.2 Notification Requirement	3
2.3 Flexibility with Regard to the Substantive Provisions of the MLI	4
3 Agreement for the Avoidance of Double Taxation as Covered Tax Agreement	4
3.1 General Remarks	4
3.2 Taxes on Income	4
3.3 Income Tax Treaties	6
3.4 Multilateral Tax Treaties	8
4 Further Potential Areas of Application	10
4.1 General Remarks	10
4.2 Tax Agreements on Estates and Inheritance and on Gifts	10
4.3 Agreements for Diplomatic Relations and Immunity	12
5 Contracting Jurisdictions	14
5.1 General Remarks	14
5.2 States as Parties to the MLI	14

Table of Contents

5.3	Non-state Jurisdictions	16
5.4	Jurisdictions with Limited Recognition of Statehood	17
6	Conclusion	18

CHAPTER 2

Interpretation of Terms Used in the Multilateral Instrument

Svetlana Wakounig 21

1	Introduction	21
2	General Interpretation	22
2.1	The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	22
2.2	Explanatory Statement	24
3	Interpretation under the MLI	25
3.1	Lessons to Be Learned from Article 3(2) of the OECD Model	25
3.2	Article 2(2) of the MLI	28
4	Terms Defined in the MLI	30
4.1	General Remarks	30
4.2	Covered Tax Agreement	31
4.3	Party	31
4.4	Contracting Jurisdiction	32
4.5	Signatory	32
4.6	Qualified Person	32
4.7	Other Definitions	33
5	Terms Not Defined in the MLI	34
5.1	Theoretical Considerations	34
5.2	Permanent Establishment	35
5.3	Dividend	36
5.4	Immovable Property	38
5.5	Residence	40
6	Conclusion	41

CHAPTER 3

The Relevance of the Conference of the Parties for the Interpretation and Amendment of the Multilateral Instrument

Raphael Holzinger 43

1	Setting the Scene: The Conference of the Parties of the Multilateral Instrument and Legal Problems	43
2	The Conference of the Parties of the MLI under Review	44
2.1	The Legal Character of the Conference of the Parties and Other Governing Bodies of the MLI	44
2.2	Parties to the Convention and the Conference of the Parties	45
2.3	The Tasks of the Conference of the Parties and Other Governing Bodies of the MLI	49

2.4	Procedural Aspects: The Conference of the Parties between Request and Outcome	50
2.5	General Aspects of Treaty Interpretation in International Law	51
2.6	Specific Interpretational Aspects of the MLI	53
2.7	General Aspects of Treaty Amendments in International Law	56
2.8	Specific Issues Regarding Amendments of the MLI	57
3	The Conference of the Parties and Its Relevance for the Interpretation and Amendments of the MLI	58
3.1	General Aspects Concerning the Relevance of the Conference of the Parties	58
3.2	Evaluating the Relevance of the Conference of the Parties for Amendments of the MLI	60
3.3	Evaluating the Relevance of the Conference of the Parties for the Interpretation of the MLI	61
4	Conclusion	64
CHAPTER 4		
Authentic Languages and Official Translations of the Multilateral Instrument and Covered Tax Agreements		
<i>Josef Schuch & Jean-Philippe Van West</i>		
		67
1	Introduction	67
2	References to the Issue of the Authentic Languages During the Development Process	68
2.1	BEPS Action 15: Deliverable and Final Report	69
2.2	BEPS Action 15: Discussion Draft and Comments Received on the Discussion Draft	70
2.3	Conclusion	71
3	Multilingual Treaties and Language Issues: General Practice	71
3.1	The Authentic Language(s) of Multilateral Treaties: A Brief Overview	71
3.2	Some Examples of the Authentic Language(s) of Multilateral Treaties	73
3.2.1	Multilateral Treaties Having a Single Authentic Language	73
3.2.2	Multilateral Treaties Having Two or More Equally Authentic Languages	73
3.2.2.1	Original Authentic Texts	73
3.2.2.2	Authentication of Other Language Versions	74
3.2.2.3	A Special Case: The European Union	74
3.2.3	Official Texts and Official Translations	75
3.3	The Interpretation of Multilingual Treaties: Article 33 of the Vienna Convention	75
3.4	Conclusion	78
4	The Authentic Languages of the MLI and Tax Treaties	78
4.1	Overview of the Most Common Practices in Tax Treaties	78

Table of Contents

4.2	The Authentic Languages of the MLI: French and English	80
4.3	Interpretation of Tax Treaties Modified by the MLI	80
4.4	Mutual Agreement and Conference of the Parties	83
4.5	Must an Interpreter Consult Both the French and English Language Versions?	84
4.6	Must the Same Value Be Given to the French and English Versions If There Is a Divergence?	84
4.7	Would a Single Authentic Language Have Been Better?	85
5	Conclusion	86

CHAPTER 5

The Legal Relevance of the Minimum Standard in the OECD/BEPS Project

Andreas Langer 89

1	General Remarks	89
2	The Content of the Minimum Standard in the MLI	91
2.1	The Minimum Standard in Article 7 of the MLI	91
2.2	The Minimum Standard in Article 14 of the MLI	94
2.3	The Minimum Standard in Article 6 of the MLI	97
2.4	The Minimum Standard in Article 17 of the MLI	98
2.5	Intermediate Results and Limitation on the Implementation of the MLI's Minimum Standard	99
3	References to the Minimum Standard as Interpretation Aid?	101
3.1	Legal Relevance of the OECD/G20 BEPS Package When Interpreting the Minimum Standard of the MLI	101
3.2	The BEPS Final Reports as Interpretation Aids under Article 31(2) of the Vienna Convention	102
3.3	The BEPS Final Reports as Special Meaning	103
3.4	Legal Relevance of a Revised Minimum Standard in the OECD/BEPS Package When Interpreting the MLI	104
4	Legal Relevance of the Minimum Standard of the OECD/G20 BEPS Package for Bilateral Negotiations	106
5	Conclusion	109

CHAPTER 6

The Relationship Between Tax Treaties and the Multilateral Instrument: Compatibility Clauses in the Multilateral Instrument

Sriram Govind & Pasquale Pistone 111

1	Introduction	111
2	The MLI and Tax Treaties	112
3	Conflict and Compatibility Clauses	115
4	Compatibility Clauses in the MLI	118
4.1	The Format of Compatibility Clauses in the MLI	118
4.2	Issues with Regard to Compatibility Clauses in the MLI	122

4.2.1	Issues with Regard to the Minimum Standards	122
4.2.2	Issues in the Positioning of Provisions	124
4.2.3	Issues in Articles with Options	126
4.2.4	Conflict in Conflict Clauses	127
5	Relationship with Other Treaties and Future Treaties	128
5.1	Relationship with Other Treaties	128
5.1.1	Interaction with EU Law	128
5.1.2	Interaction with International Investment Treaties	131
5.1.3	Interaction with Trade Agreements	132
5.2	Interaction with Future Treaties	133
6	Conclusion	135
7	Annexe	137

CHAPTER 7

Options under the Multilateral Instrument

Alexandra Miladinovic & Alexander Rust 139

1	Introduction	139
2	Different Types of Options	140
2.1	Types of Options According to the BEPS Action 15 Final Report	140
2.1.1	BEPS Action 15 Final Report	140
2.1.2	Opt-Out Clauses	141
2.1.3	Opt-In Clauses	142
2.1.4	Alternative Provisions	144
2.1.5	Analysis and Suitability of These Categories	146
2.2	Classification of the Options According to the Articles of the OECD Model Convention	147
2.3	Classification of the Options According to Their Purpose	148
2.4	Classification of the Options According to Legal Consequences	152
3	Exercise of Options	156
3.1	Notifications and Reservations	156
3.2	Timing of the Exercise of the Option	158
3.3	Reversibility of Options	159
3.3.1	Legitimate Interests to Reverse Options	159
3.3.2	First-Time Exercise of Options after Conclusion	159
3.3.3	Change or Replacement of Options after Conclusion	162
3.3.4	Withdrawal of Options after Conclusion	163
4	Conclusion	164

CHAPTER 8

Reservations to the Multilateral Instrument

Benjamin Walker 165

1	Introduction	165
2	Background	165

Table of Contents

2.1	Generally	165
2.2	What Constitutes a Reservation?	166
2.3	History	167
2.4	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	167
3	Reservation Article	168
3.1	Rationale of the MLI	168
3.2	Reservations under the MLI	169
3.3	Scope	169
3.4	Categories of Reservations	170
3.4.1	Minimum Standard Reservations	170
3.4.2	Non-minimum Standard Reservations	173
3.4.3	Arbitration Reservations	176
3.4.4	Other Reservations	178
3.4.5	Summary of Reservations	178
3.5	Legal Effect of a Reservation	178
3.5.1	Legal Consequences of Impermissible Reservations	179
3.6	Timing of a Reservation	181
3.7	Notification of a Reservation	183
3.8	Later Withdrawal	186
4	Conclusion	189

CHAPTER 9

Notifications According to the Multilateral Instrument and Consolidated Versions of Tax Treaties

Christiane Zöhrer

		191
1	Ensuring Legal Certainty	191
2	Notifications	192
2.1	Scope	192
2.2	Dispatch and Receipt of Notifications	194
2.2.1	Dispatch of Notifications	194
2.2.2	Receipt of Notifications	196
2.3	Form and Content of Notifications	197
2.3.1	Form of Notifications	197
2.3.2	Content of Notifications	198
2.4	Role of the Depositary	201
3	Consolidated Version	202
3.1	Classification of Consolidated Versions	202
3.2	Benefits of Consolidated Versions	203
3.3	Challenges Associated with Developing Consolidated Versions	205
3.4	Potential Legal and Practical Difficulties	207
4	Conclusion	209

CHAPTER 10

Consequences of Withdrawal from or Termination of the Multilateral Instrument

<i>Benedikt Hörtenhuber</i>	211
1 Introduction	211
2 Implementation and Effectiveness of the MLI	212
2.1 Negotiation and Signature	212
2.2 Entry into Force	213
2.3 Entry into Effect	215
2.4 Relationship Between the MLI and Covered Tax Agreements	216
3 Withdrawal from the MLI	217
3.1 Specific Provision in Article 37 of the MLI	217
3.2 Procedural Requirements	218
3.2.1 Any Party	218
3.2.2 At Any Time	218
3.2.3 Notification Addressed to the Depository	218
3.2.4 Effective Date of the Withdrawal	219
3.3 Consequences of a Withdrawal	219
3.3.1 Covered Tax Agreement Shall Remain as Modified by the MLI	220
3.3.2 Withdrawal Will Not Affect Contractual Duties in the Covered Tax Agreement Between the Contracting Jurisdictions	220
3.3.3 Effects of the Withdrawal Are Forward-Looking (Ex Nunc)	221
3.3.4 Future Changes to the MLI Itself Will Not Affect the Leaving Party's Tax Agreements	222
3.3.5 Entry into Effect Pursuant to Article 35 of the MLI Is Not Decisive	222
3.3.6 Termination of Rights and Obligations under the MLI	223
3.3.7 Withdrawal Will Not Terminate the MLI	223
3.3.8 Summary of Main Findings	224
3.4 Example	224
4 Termination of the MLI	225
4.1 Absence of Specific Provisions in the MLI	225
4.2 Fundamental Principles of the Vienna Convention	225
4.2.1 Termination in Conformity with the Provisions of the Treaty	226
4.2.2 Termination of the Treaty by Consent of All Parties	226
4.2.3 Treaty Containing No Provision Regarding Termination	227
4.2.4 Brief Summary	228
4.3 Reasons for the Termination	228

Table of Contents

4.3.1	Necessary Number of Contracting Parties: Article 55 of the Vienna Convention	228
4.3.2	Conclusion of a Later Convention: Article 59 of the Vienna Convention	228
4.3.3	Termination as a Consequence of a Breach of the MLI: Article 60 of the Vienna Convention	229
4.4	Procedural Requirements	230
4.4.1	Notification	230
4.4.2	Objection	231
4.4.3	Expiry of at Least a Three-Month Period	231
4.5	Consequences of a Termination	231
4.5.1	Consequences of the Termination of the MLI: Article 70 of the Vienna Convention	232
4.5.2	Unless the Treaty Otherwise Provides	233
4.5.3	Unless the Parties Otherwise Agree	233
4.5.4	Releases the Parties from Any Obligation Further to Perform the MLI	234
4.5.5	Does Not Affect Any Right, Obligation or Legal Situation of the Parties Created Through the Execution of the Treaty Prior to Its Termination	234
4.5.6	Subsequent Modification of Tax Treaties	235
5	Conclusion	235
CHAPTER 11		
Future Changes to Covered Tax Agreements and of the Multilateral Convention to Implement Tax Treaty-Related Measures to Prevent BEPS		
<i>Nathalie Bravo</i>		
		237
1	Introduction	237
2	Amendment of Covered Tax Agreements	238
3	Modifications of Provisions of Covered Tax Agreements as Modified Through the MLI	240
3.1	Interpretation of Article 30 of the MLI with Regard to Provisions of Covered Tax Agreements as Modified Through the MLI	240
3.2	Are There Grounds for an Alternative Interpretation of Article 30 of the MLI?	243
3.3	Notifications Regarding Subsequent Modifications	249
4	Amendments of the MLI	254
5	Alternative Amendment Procedures of Multilateral Treaties	259
6	Conclusion	263
	Index	265