

Contents



Preface	xv
1 A COMMITTEE APPROACH	1
Introduction: What Is an Ethics Committee?	1
Bioethics and Philosophy	1
Description of the Committee	3
Practice and Bioethics	4
The Functions of the Committee	5
The Place of Theory	7
Types of Consequentialism	8
Act Utilitarianism	8
Rule Utilitarianism	9
Deontology	10
Kant's Theory	10
Multi-ruled Deontology	11
Four Basic Questions	12
Consequentialist Answers	13
Rights-based Answers	14
Additional Ethical Perspectives	15
The Setting: Community Hospital	16
The Members of the Committee	17
2 FORGOING TREATMENT	20
Introduction to the Problem	20
Medical Rescues	20
Rescue Policy	22
Community Hospital Policy for Forgoing Medical Treatment	23
Commentary on the Philosophical and Ethical Aspects of the Policy	26
Autonomy as Noninterference	26
Deliberative Autonomy	27

Existentialist Autonomy	28
Organic and Autonomous Societies	29
A Weak Ethic	31
Futility and Forgoing Treatment	32
Competence and Forgoing Treatment	34
Advance Directives	35
Guardianship	36
Best Interests	37
The Case of William Revel	38
Committee Discussion of the Case	39
General Discussion of the Case	44
Discussion of the Recommendation and Action	52
Further Questions Regarding the Ethics of the Case	55
More Cases for Examination	56
The Smith Case	56
Possible Senility and the Duty to Resuscitate	57
Withdrawal without Autonomous Consent	57
Family Wishes and Harm to the Patient	58
3 EUTHANASIA	62
Introduction to the Problem	62
A Definition	63
Active Euthanasia and Murder	63
Community Hospital's Policy on Active Euthanasia	64
Commentary on the Philosophical and Ethical Aspects of the Policy	66
The Distinction between Active and Passive Euthanasia	66
Autonomy and Active Euthanasia	68
The Slippery Slope and Active Euthanasia	72
Holland and Active Euthanasia	76
Euthanasia and the Patient-Doctor Relationship	78
Physician-Assisted Suicide	80
The Case of Debbie II	81
Committee Discussion of the Case	82
Further Questions Concerning the Case and the Policy	99
More Cases Involving the Policy	100
Assisted Suicide	100
A Decision to Assist Suicide	100
Dr. Spicer's Nurse	101

4	INFORMED CONSENT	103
	Introduction to the Problem Area	103
	Explain Everything!	103
	Explain Nothing!	104
	Selecting Terminology	104
	Harming the Patient	104
	Competence and Informed Consent	105
	Manipulation	105
	Informed Consent Documents	105
	Informed Consent Policy of Community Hospital	106
	Commentary on the Philosophical and Ethical Aspects of the Policy	107
	Therapeutic Privilege	108
	The Critics of Informed Consent	109
	The Roots of Informed Consent	110
	Informed Consent as a Right	110
	Informed Consent and the Physician-Patient Relationship	112
	Adequate Disclosure	117
	Diminished Capacity	119
	Patient Understanding	122
	Waivers	123
	Voluntary Consent	124
	The Case of Warren Hayes	125
	Committee Discussion of the Case	125
	Consent to Operation or Other Procedure	126
	Questions for Further Discussion	146
	More Cases Involving the Policy	147
	Muscular Dystrophy and the Adolescent	147
	Transplantation and Informed Consent	148
	Depression and Informed Consent	148
	The Drunk and Informed Consent	149
5	REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS: SURROGACY	152
	Introduction to the Problem Area	152
	Two Attitudes toward Technology	153
	The Basis of the Surrogacy Conflict	153
	Surrogacy and the Women's Movement	154
	Background on the Surrogacy Policy	155
	Community Hospital's Surrogacy Policy	156
	Commentary on the Philosophical and Ethical Aspects of the Policy	160
	Paternalism and Surrogacy	160

	The Validity of Surrogacy Contracts	164
	Surrogacy and Exploitation	165
	Surrogacy and Commodification	167
	A Religious Objection	168
	The Public-Private Distinction and Surrogacy	169
	The Hermeneutical Model	171
	Surrogacy and the Hermeneutic Model	173
	The Case of Mr. and Mrs. Douglas and Harriet Neil	174
	Agreements	174
	Committee Discussion of the Case	175
	Questions for Further Discussion	193
	More Cases for Examination	194
	The Single Parent and the New Partnership	194
	Surrogacy and the Middle-Age Couple	195
6	ABORTION	198
	Introduction to the Problem Area	198
	Terminology and Fetal Development	198
	Abortion Methods	200
	History	201
	The Elements of <i>Roe v. Wade</i>	202
	The Ethical Aspects of Abortion	203
	Abortion and the Hospital	206
	Community Hospital's Policy on Abortion	207
	Commentary on the Philosophical and Ethical Aspects of the Policy	208
	The Orthodox View	209
	A New Version of the Orthodox View	211
	Criticisms of the Orthodox View	212
	The Radical View	214
	Criticisms of the Radical View	216
	The Moderate View	217
	Criticisms of the Moderate View	219
	The Case of Delise Fortune	219
	Committee Discussion of the Case	220
	Questions for Further Discussion	242
	More Cases for Examination	243
	The Nurse and the Abortion Demand	243
	Abortion and the Mentally Handicapped	243
	The 15-Year-Old and RU 486	244
	The Resident's Demand	244

7	RATIONING HEALTH CARE	247
	Introduction to the Problem Area	247
	The Rich Man's Solution	248
	The Oregon Solution	249
	Why Committees?	250
	The President's Commission	251
	Community Hospital's Policy on Rationing	252
	Commentary on the Philosophical and Ethical Aspects of the Policy	254
	Consequences and Scarcity	254
	Laissez-Faire Justice	255
	Laissez-Faire and Rights	257
	Egalitarianism	258
	Marxist Justice	259
	Welfare State Justice	260
	Rawls's Compromise	262
	Justice and Microallocation	264
	A Rights-Based Approach	265
	Criticisms of the Policy	266
	Replies to Criticisms	267
	The Case of Coretta Anderson	268
	Committee Discussion of the Case	269
	Questions for Further Discussion	293
	More Cases Involving the Policy	294
	Suppose the Government Abandoned Dialysis	294
	The Case of Carl Petersen	294
	Futility Scarcity and Blood	295
8	AIDS	298
	Introduction to the Problem Area	298
	AIDS and Scarcity	298
	AIDS and Informed Consent	299
	AIDS and the Patient-Professional Relationship	300
	AIDS and Society	300
	AIDS and Confidentiality	301
	Community Hospital's Policy on AIDS	302
	Commentary on the Philosophical and Ethical Aspects of the Policy	304
	The Virtue Approach	304
	Why Virtue?	306
	Narratives and Moral Conflict	308

	Virtue and Greek Philosophy	309
	Virtue as Knowledge	310
	Virtue as Habit	311
	Virtue and Religion	311
	AIDS and Virtue	312
	Virtue and Existentialism	313
	Five Virtues in Medicine	315
	The Case of Dr. John Doe	320
	Committee Discussion of the Case	321
	Committee Recommendations	338
	Questions for Further Discussion	340
	More Cases Involving the Policy	340
	Dr. Marriot	340
	AIDS and the Family Practitioner	341
	AIDS and the Married Couple	341
	Revealing HIV Status to a Relative	341
9	MEDICAL RESEARCH INVOLVING PERSONS	344
	Introduction to the Problem Area	344
	Two American Cases	345
	Protectionism	345
	Community Hospital's Policy on Human Subject Research	349
	Commentary on the Philosophical and Ethical Aspects of the Policy	352
	Research Involving Competent Adults	352
	The Informed Consent Compromise	352
	A Case Involving the Informed Consent Compromise	353
	Three Problems with the Informed Consent Compromise	354
	Clinical Trials as Waivers	357
	Research Involving Children	357
	Research Involving Animals	360
	The Rights of Animals	360
	The Traditional Arguments	362
	The Case of Herpes Simplex Encephalitis	362
	Committee Discussion of the Case	363
	Questions for Further Discussion	387
	More Cases Involving the Policy	388
	The Use of Animals in Research	388
	Competency and Research	388

	A Desperate Volunteer	388
	Using Prisoners	390
10	PEDIATRIC ETHICS	392
	Introduction to the Problem Area	392
	A Competency Continuum	392
	Autonomy and Best Interests	393
	The Health Care Provider and Best Interest	394
	Conflict of Interest	395
	Justice in Pediatrics	395
	Community Hospital's Policy on Pediatric Withdrawal	396
	Commentary on the Philosophical and Ethical Aspects of the Policy	398
	Best Interest	398
	The Procedural Compromise	403
	Uncertainty and Futility	404
	The Capacity to Interact as a Person	406
	The Case of Baby John Fitzer	410
	Committee Discussion of the Case	411
	Committee Recommendations	434
	Questions for Further Discussion	436
	More Cases Involving the Policy	436
	DNR and the Anencephalic Infant	436
	Down Syndrome and Permission for Surgery	437
	A Nurse Objects to Withdrawal	437
	Patients' Diverse Religious and Cultural Values	438
INDEX		441