

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----|
| <i>List of Figures and Tables</i> | xv |
| Introduction | 1 |
| PART I DOCTRINE, DEFINITIONS, AND METAPHYSICS | |
| 1. The Content of Conciliar Christology | 11 |
| 2. Definitions and Necessary Conditions | 29 |
| 3. The Theory Enfleshed | 58 |
| PART II THE FUNDAMENTAL PROBLEM | |
| 4. The Fundamental Problem | 75 |
| 5. Denying the Predications | 97 |
| 6. Denying “In the Same Way” | 117 |
| 7. Denying the Incompatibility | 152 |
| PART III ADDITIONAL METAPHYSICAL OBJECTIONS | |
| 8. Immutability, Impassibility, and Atemporality | 179 |
| 9. Number Troubles | 210 |
| Conclusion | 232 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 235 |
| <i>Index</i> | 247 |

Extended Table of Contents

| | |
|---|-----------|
| <i>List of Figures and Tables</i> | <i>xv</i> |
| Introduction | 1 |
| PART I DOCTRINE, DEFINITIONS, AND METAPHYSICS | |
| 1. The Content of Conciliar Christology | 11 |
| I. Introduction | 11 |
| II. Concerning the Person of Christ | 14 |
| III. Concerning the Divine Nature | 16 |
| IV. Concerning the Human Nature of Christ | 18 |
| V. Concerning the Manner of Union between the Natures | 20 |
| VI. Concerning the Predications True of Christ | 23 |
| VII. Conclusion | 27 |
| 2. Definitions and Necessary Conditions | 29 |
| I. Introduction | 29 |
| II. Terminology | 30 |
| II.a. Hypostasis and Person | 30 |
| II.b. Nature | 34 |
| II.b.1. Two Views of Natures: Abstract and Concrete | 34 |
| II.b.2. Nature Talk in the Conciliar Texts | 39 |
| II.b.3. The Historic and Contemporary Understandings of the Human Nature of Christ | 42 |
| II.c. The Terms used to Refer to the Person and Natures | 46 |
| III. The Necessary Conditions | 47 |
| IV. The Bare Bones Model | 50 |
| IV.a. The Concrete Natures of Material Substances | 50 |
| IV.b. The Ontological Conditions for Contingent Predications | 52 |
| IV.c. The Divine Nature | 53 |
| IV.d. The Relation between Truth and Reality | 54 |
| IV.e. The Hypostatic Union | 55 |
| IV.f. Fulfillment of the Necessary Conditions | 56 |
| V. Conclusion | 57 |
| 3. The Theory Enfleshed | 58 |
| I. Introduction | 58 |
| II. Hylomorphism | 58 |
| III. Truthmaking | 59 |
| III.a. Truthmakers for Essential Predications | 60 |
| III.b. Truthmakers for Accidental Predications | 61 |
| IV. Applied to the Incarnation | 62 |

| | |
|--|----|
| IV.a. The Model and Candidate Predicates | 62 |
| IV.b. The Model and the <i>Communicatio Idiomatum</i> | 63 |
| V. A Summary of the Model | 64 |
| VI. Objections to the Model | 64 |
| Objection 1: The Objection from Property Borrowing | 64 |
| Objection 2: The Objection from the Relation between Persons and Natures | 65 |
| Objection 3: The Objection from the Lack of a Truthmaker for Supposit Truths | 68 |
| Objection 4: The Objection from Essential Predications and the Possibility of Christ's Human Nature not Being Assumed | 70 |
| VII. Conclusion | 71 |

PART II THE FUNDAMENTAL PROBLEM

| | |
|---|-----|
| 4. The Fundamental Problem | 75 |
| I. Introduction | 75 |
| II. The Argument in Detail | 75 |
| II.a. The Argument in the Literature | 75 |
| II.b. Definitions of the Terms | 77 |
| II.c. The Argument in Deductive Form | 79 |
| III. Denying No Complementary Predications | 80 |
| III.a. A Plausible Inference | 80 |
| III.b. The Standard Definition of Complementarity | 81 |
| III.c. No Complementary Predications or No Contrary Predications | 82 |
| IV. Some Unsatisfactory Responses | 84 |
| IV.a. Deny the Law of Non-Contradiction | 84 |
| IV.b. Deny that Candidate Predicates Have Complements | 85 |
| IV.c. Appeal to Mystery | 88 |
| V. The Shape of Things to Come | 91 |
| VI. Conclusion | 95 |
| 5. Denying the Predications | 97 |
| I. Introduction | 97 |
| II. The Response from Denying the Divine Candidate Predicates of Christ | 98 |
| II.a. An Example of the Response | 98 |
| II.b. The Response is not Generalizable | 99 |
| III. The Response from Denying the Human Candidate Predicates of Christ | 100 |
| III.a. An Example of the Response | 100 |
| III.b. The Response is not Generalizable | 101 |
| IV. The Responses from Denying the Human and Divine Candidate Predicates of Christ in Conjunction are Insufficient | 101 |
| V. The Response of Denying the Predicates "At the Same Time" | 104 |
| V.a. An Example of the Response | 104 |
| V.b. Kenoticism is Inconsistent with Conciliar Christology | 106 |
| V.b.1. Immutability and Kenoticism | 107 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| V.b.2. Kenoticism and Conciliar Predication | 110 |
| V.b.3. A Final Formulation of the Argument | 113 |
| V.c. Kenoticism and the Exaltation | 114 |
| VI. Conclusion | 115 |
| 6. Denying “In the Same Way” | 117 |
| I. Introduction | 117 |
| II. The “Qua” Move | 118 |
| III. Modifying the Assertion (A) | 121 |
| III.a. The (A) Method Presented | 122 |
| III.b. The (A) Method Fails | 122 |
| III.c. The (A) Understanding of “Qua” Without the (A) Response to the Problem | 123 |
| IV. Modifying the Subject (S) | 124 |
| IV.a. The (S) Method Presented | 124 |
| IV.b. The (S) Method Fails | 125 |
| V. Modifying the Predicate (P) | 129 |
| V.a. Non-Substitutional Predicate Modifying | 131 |
| Objection 1: Ad Hoc Worries | 132 |
| Objection 2: The Objection from Uncommon Predicates | 133 |
| Objection 3: The Objection from Cheap Predicates | 135 |
| Objection 4: Predications Qua-Modifiable to Neither or Both Natures | 137 |
| V.b. Substitutional Predicate Modifying | 137 |
| Objection 1: Ad Hoc Worries | 138 |
| Objection 2: The Objection from Uncommon Predicates | 139 |
| Objection 3: The Objection from Cheap Predicates | 139 |
| Objection 4: Predications Qua-Modifiable to Neither or Both Natures | 140 |
| Objection 5: The Objection from Redundant Relata | 140 |
| V.c. Summary of the Discussion of the (P) Strategy | 141 |
| VI. Modifying the Copula (C) | 143 |
| VI.a. Non-Substitutional Copula Modifying | 145 |
| Objection 1: Ad Hoc Worries | 145 |
| Objection 2: The Objection from Uncommon Characterizing | 146 |
| Objection 3: The Objection from Cheap Copulation | 146 |
| Objection 4: Predications Qua-Modifiable to Neither or Both Natures | 147 |
| Objection 5: The Objection from Copula Modifying Being Difficult to Fathom | 147 |
| Objection 6: The Objection from Revising Standard Logic | 147 |
| VI.b. Substitutional Copula Modifying | 148 |
| Objection 1: Ad Hoc Worries | 148 |
| Objection 2: The Objection from Uncommon Characterizing | 148 |
| Objection 3: The Objection from Cheap Copulation | 149 |
| Objection 4: Characterizations Qua-Modifiable to Neither or Both Natures | 149 |
| Objection 5: The Objection from Redundant Relata | 149 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Objection 6: The Objection from Copula Modifying Being Difficult to Fathom | 150 |
| Objection 7: The Objection from Revising Logic | 150 |
| VII. Conclusion | 150 |
| 7. Denying the Incompatibility | 152 |
| I. Introduction | 152 |
| II. The Truth Conditions for Candidate Predicates | 154 |
| II.a. Initial Truth Conditions | 154 |
| II.b. The Cheerleader Analogy | 155 |
| II.c. Applying the Analogy to Christ | 157 |
| II.d. Revised Truth Conditions | 159 |
| III. The Logical Relations among the Revised Truth Conditions | 159 |
| III.a. The Predicates and Their Truth Conditions | 160 |
| III.b. Question Sets | 160 |
| III.c. The Logical Relations Presented | 165 |
| IV. Explaining Our Intuitions | 167 |
| IV.a. If “x is non-F” is True, then “it is not the case that x is F” is True | 167 |
| IV.b. Intuitive Incompatibility | 168 |
| V. Objections to the Reply from Denying the Incompatibility | 168 |
| Objection 1: Out of the Blue | 169 |
| Objection 2: No Natures | 171 |
| Objection 3: Difference Where There is None | 171 |
| Objection 4: Qua-Strategy Restated | 171 |
| Objection 5: Predications of Natures | 172 |
| Objection 6: Other Candidate Predicates | 173 |
| Objection 7: Ontological Bloat to Predicates | 174 |
| Objection 8: Evacuating Classical Theism | 174 |
| VI. Conclusion | 175 |

PART III ADDITIONAL METAPHYSICAL OBJECTIONS

| | |
|---|------------|
| 8. Immutability, Impassibility, and Atemporality | 179 |
| I. Introduction | 179 |
| II. Motivation for the Doctrines | 180 |
| II.a. The Motivation for Divine Immutability | 181 |
| II.b. The Motivation for Divine Impassibility | 184 |
| II.c. The Motivation for Divine Atemporality | 187 |
| III. The Truth Conditions for the Predicates | 190 |
| IV. Objections to the Incarnation of an Immutable, Impassible, Atemporal God | 191 |
| IV.a. Richard Cross on the Modal Attributes | 192 |
| IV.b. Jonathan Hill on the Modal Attributes | 194 |
| IV.c. Richard Holland on the Modal Attributes | 198 |
| IV.d. Thomas Senor on the Modal Attributes | 200 |
| IV.e. A Few General Points about These Objections | 203 |
| V. How the Metaphysics Might Work | 204 |
| VI. Conclusion | 209 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 9. Number Troubles | 210 |
| I. Introduction | 210 |
| II. Unfriendly Conditionals | 210 |
| II.a. The Definition of Unfriendly Conditionals and Why They are Unfriendly | 210 |
| II.b. Unfriendly Conditionals and the (Alleged) Unicity of Christ's Nature, Will, or Intellect | 212 |
| II.c. The Definitions of Person, Nature, Will, and Intellect | 213 |
| III. Assertions of Number Troubles | 215 |
| IV. Arguments for Number Troubles | 217 |
| IV.a. Garrett DeWeese on Number Troubles | 218 |
| IV.b. Colin Gunton on Number Troubles | 221 |
| IV.c. Andrew Loke on Number Troubles | 222 |
| V. The Threat of Nestorianism | 227 |
| VI. Conclusion | 231 |
| Conclusion | 232 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 235 |
| <i>Index</i> | 247 |