
Religious Zionism,
Jewish Law, and The
Morality of War

*How Five Rabbis Confronted One of
Modern Judaism's Greatest Challenges*



Robert Eisen

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>xv</i>
1. Introduction	1
Religious Zionism: An Overview	6
Religious Zionism and War	13
The Theological Dimension	13
The Halakhic Dimension	15
Israel and the Waging of War: The Halakhic Obstacles	18
Mandatory War, Discretionary War, and Legitimate Authority	18
Conscription	19
Civilian Casualties	20
Ritual Observances	21
The Three Oaths	22
The Goals of This Study	22
2. War in Jewish Law before Zionism	29
Varieties of War and Legitimate Authority: The Maimonidean Framework	30
Nahmanides: The Commandment to Conquer the Land of Israel	37
Preemptive War	41
Israel and the Waging of War: The Halakhic Obstacles Revisited	42
Mandatory War, Discretionary War, and Legitimate Authority	42
Conscription	43
Civilian Casualties	49
Appendix: Summary of Laws of War in Medieval Halakhah	55
3. R. Abraham Isaac Kook	56
The Exchange with R. Pines: War and Risking One's Life for Others	59
R. Kook on Discretionary War: Further Reflections	73
Appendix: Outline of the Debate on War between R. Kook and R. Pines	80

4. R. Isaac Halevi Herzog	82	
The Two Responsa to the Ezra Movement		84
The First Responsum	85	
The Second Responsum	96	
The Exchange with R. Meshulam Roth		103
5. R. Eliezer Yehudah Waldenberg	114	
<i>Hilkhot Medinah</i> II, 4:3	115	
<i>Tsits Eli'ezer</i> 12:57, 13:100	121	
6. R. Sha'ul Yisraeli: The Essay on Kibiyeh	129	
Clarifying the Contents of the Essay	131	
The Kibiyeh Raid as Discretionary War	136	
The Kibiyeh Raid as Mandatory War	143	
How Radical an Essay?	148	
The Question of Halakhic Precedent	158	
7. R. Sha'ul Yisraeli: The Later Writings	167	
Preliminary Reflections	168	
<i>Erets Hemdah</i> I: The New Paradigm for Conscription	170	
<i>'Amud ha-Yemini</i> : Rashi's Position on Discretionary War	173	
<i>Torah she-be-'al Peh</i> 10: Rashi and Maimonides on War	175	
<i>Tehumin</i> 2: A Theological Approach to Conscription	177	
<i>Tehumin</i> 10: The Commandment to Conquer the Land of Israel	181	
<i>Shevilin</i> 29–30: The Entebbe Raid	184	
8. R. Shlomo Goren	193	
The Theological Background	197	
The Methodology of Wartime Halakhah	199	
Which Wars Are Permissible for the State of Israel?	200	
Defensive War	200	
Discretionary War	204	
Mandatory War in <i>Sefer ha-Mitsvot</i>	207	
War For Conquering the Land of Israel	208	
Conscription	212	
R. Goren's Right Turn	219	
Civilian Casualties	222	
The Siege of Beirut	228	
The Siege of Tripoli	229	

9. Summary and Conclusions	241
A Recap of the Major Questions	241
Permitted Wars and Legitimate Authority	242
Conscription	247
Civilian Casualties	251
The Relationship of Wartime Halakhah to Everyday Halakhah	254
Halakhah versus International Law	260
<i>Works Cited</i>	273
<i>Index Locorum</i>	283
<i>General Index</i>	287