

International Climate Change Law

DANIEL BODANSKY
JUTTA BRUNNÉE
LAVANYA RAJAMANI

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Table of Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of International Instruments and National Legislation</i>	xix
<i>List of Acronyms</i>	xxxv
1. Introduction	1
I. Climate change as an intractable policy challenge	2
II. Three perspectives on the climate change problem	4
A. Climate change as an environmental problem	5
B. Climate change as an economic problem	6
C. Climate change as an ethical problem	7
III. Demarcating international climate change law	10
IV. The subject matter of international climate change law	11
A. Mitigation	12
B. Adaptation	14
C. Finance	14
D. Oversight	16
V. Recurring themes in the UN climate regime	17
A. Legal bindingness	17
1. Treaties	18
2. Decisions of parties	19
3. Political agreements	20
B. Architecture	22
C. Differentiation	26
VI. The broader context for international climate change law	30
Select Bibliography	34
2. Climate Change and International Law	35
I. Introduction	35
II. The sources of international law	36
III. Key principles of international environmental law	40
A. The no-harm rule and related principles	40
1. Harm prevention and due diligence	41
2. Procedural obligations	42
3. Prevention and precaution	43
B. Establishing state responsibility for violation of the no-harm rule	44
1. General considerations	44
2. Legal action for climate harm—some examples	46
C. Invoking state responsibility for harm to the global commons	49
D. Common concern and common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities	51
E. Precaution, sustainable development, and the intertemporal reach of international environmental law	53

IV.	Treaty-based approaches to environmental protection	55
A.	Treaty development over time	56
1.	The framework-protocol model	57
2.	Institutionalization	57
3.	Ongoing standard-setting processes	59
B.	Treaty design to induce participation	61
C.	Promotion of implementation and compliance	64
1.	Emergence of the implementation and compliance focus	65
2.	Modern multilateral environmental agreements and compliance	65
V.	Conclusion	68
	Select Bibliography	70
3.	Treaty-Based Law-Making: Rules, Tools, and Techniques	72
I.	Introduction	72
II.	Treaties and treaty-based law-making	72
A.	What is a treaty?	72
B.	Treaty negotiations	73
1.	The pre-negotiation phase: issue, forum, and mandate	73
2.	The negotiating process	75
C.	Adoption, signature, ratification, and entry into force of treaties	82
D.	Treaty development	85
1.	New treaties to supplement the framework	86
2.	Amendments	88
3.	Decisions of the parties	90
4.	Political agreements	91
5.	Ambiguity, interpretation, and subsequent practice	92
III.	Conclusion	94
	Select Bibliography	95
4.	Evolution of the United Nations Climate Regime	96
I.	Introduction	96
II.	Agenda-setting (1985–1990)	97
III.	Constitutional phase: negotiation and entry into force of the FCCC (1990–1995)	102
IV.	Regulatory phase: negotiation and elaboration of the kyoto protocol (1995–2005)	105
V.	Second constitutional phase: negotiating the future climate regime (2005–2016)	108
A.	Bali Action Plan	110
B.	Copenhagen Accord	110
C.	Cancun Agreements	112
D.	Durban Platform and Doha Amendment	113
VI.	Conclusion	115
	Select Bibliography	117
5.	The Framework Convention on Climate Change	118
I.	Introduction	118

II.	Overarching issues	119
	A. Legal bindingness	119
	B. Architecture	120
	C. Scope	120
	D. Differentiation	121
III.	Preamble, objective, and principles (Articles 2 and 3)	123
	A. Preamble	123
	B. Objective (Article 2)	125
	C. Principles (Article 3)	126
	1. Background	126
	2. Principle of common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities	127
	3. Precaution and cost-effectiveness	128
	4. Sustainable development	129
	5. Supportive and open economic system	129
IV.	Commitments (Articles 4–6 and 12)	130
	A. General commitments (Articles 4.1, 5, 6, and 12.1)	130
	B. Mitigation (Articles 4.1(b)–(d) and 4.2)	131
	1. Targets and timetables	132
	2. Comprehensive approach	133
	3. Joint implementation	134
	C. Adaptation (Articles 4.1(b) and (e), 4.8, and 4.9)	135
	D. Financial support (Articles 4.3 and 4.4)	137
	E. Technology transfer (Article 4.5)	140
	F. Transparency (Articles 4.1(a) and 12)	141
V.	Institutions (Articles 7–11)	141
	A. Conference of the Parties (Article 7)	142
	B. Secretariat (Article 8)	143
	C. Subsidiary Body for Scientific and Technological Advice (Article 9)	144
	D. Subsidiary Body for Implementation (Article 10)	145
	E. Financial mechanism (Articles 11 and 21.3)	145
VI.	Implementation and compliance mechanisms (Articles 7.2 and 12–14)	148
	A. Overview	148
	B. Reporting (Article 12)	149
	C. International review (Article 7.2)	151
	D. Multilateral consultative process to resolve questions regarding implementation (Article 13)	153
	E. Dispute settlement (Article 14)	154
VII.	Final clauses (Articles 15–25)	155
	A. Amendments, annexes, and protocols to the convention (Articles 15, 16, and 17)	155
	B. Voting rights, signature, and ratification (Articles 18, 20, and 22)	156
	C. Entry into force (Article 23)	157
	D. Reservations and withdrawal (Articles 24 and 25)	157
VIII.	Conclusion	158
	Select Bibliography	158

6. Kyoto Protocol	160
I. Introduction	160
II. Overarching issues	161
A. Legal bindingness	161
B. Architecture	163
C. Scope	163
D. Differentiation	165
1. Differentiation between Annex I and non-Annex I parties	166
2. Differentiation within the category of Annex I parties	167
3. Voluntary commitments for developing countries	168
III. Preamble and definitions (Article 1)	169
IV. Commitments (Articles 2, 3, 5, 7, 8, 10, and 11)	169
A. General commitments	170
B. Specific commitments for Annex I and Annex II parties	170
1. Policies and measures (Article 2)	170
2. Mitigation targets and timetables (Article 3)	171
a) Legal character	172
b) Differentiated targets	172
c) Collective target	174
d) Base year	174
e) Assigned amount units	175
f) Sinks	175
g) Multi-year commitment period	176
h) Banking	177
i) Joint fulfilment	178
3. Financial support (Article 11)	179
V. Mechanisms (Articles 6, 12, and 17)	179
A. Joint implementation (Article 6)	180
B. Clean Development Mechanism (Article 12)	182
1. Additionality	183
2. Sustainable development	185
3. Project eligibility	186
4. Project types	188
a) Unilateral CDM	188
b) Programmatic CDM	188
c) Other project types	188
5. Equitable geographical distribution of CDM projects	189
6. Share of proceeds	190
C. Emissions trading (Article 17)	190
D. Outlook	192
VI. Reporting, review, and compliance (Articles 5, 7, 8, and 18)	193
A. Reporting and review (Articles 5, 7, and 8)	193
B. Compliance procedures and mechanisms	195
1. Context and goals	195
2. Triggers	196
3. The Compliance Committee and its process	197
a) The facilitative branch	197
b) The enforcement branch	198
4. Outlook	200

VII. Institutions (Articles 13, 14, and 15)	200
VIII. Multilateral consultative process (Article 16)	201
IX. Final clauses (Articles 19–28)	201
X. The second and future commitment periods of the Kyoto Protocol	202
XI. Conclusion	206
Select Bibliography	208
7. Paris Agreement	209
I. Introduction	209
II. Overarching issues	210
A. Legal bindingness	210
1. Legal form of the 2015 agreement	210
2. Legal character of the provisions in the 2015 agreement	213
B. Architecture	214
C. Scope	215
D. Differentiation	219
1. The CBDRRC principle in the Paris Agreement	221
2. Operationalizing the CBDRRC principle in the Paris Agreement	222
a) Differentiation in mitigation	223
b) Differentiation in transparency	224
c) Differentiation in finance	225
III. Preamble	226
IV. Purpose (Articles 2 and 4.1)	228
V. Mitigation (Article 4)	231
A. Obligations in relation to nationally determined contributions (NDCs)	231
B. Registering NDCs	233
C. Progression in NDCs	233
D. Ambition cycle	235
VI. Market-based approaches (Article 6)	236
VII. Adaptation (Article 7)	237
VIII. Loss and damage (Article 8)	238
IX. Support (Articles 9, 10, and 11)	240
A. Finance	240
1. Financial commitments	240
2. Donor pool	241
3. Mobilization goal	241
B. Technology	241
C. Capacity-building	241
X. Oversight system (Articles 13, 14, and 15)	242
A. Transparency (Article 13)	242
B. Global stocktake (Article 14)	244
C. Implementation and Compliance Mechanism (Article 15)	246
XI. Institutions (Articles 16–19)	246
XII. Final clauses (Articles 20–28)	247
XIII. Next steps	247

XIV. Conclusion	249
Select Bibliography	250
8. Climate Governance beyond the United Nations Climate Regime	258
I. Introduction	258
II. Multi-level climate governance	260
III. Public and private climate governance	264
IV. Climate governance by other multilateral institutions	266
A. Bunker emissions	268
1. International Maritime Organization	268
2. International Civil Aviation Organization	270
B. Ozone-depleting substances	273
C. Black carbon and other short-lived climate forcers	275
D. UN Security Council	277
E. Informal political forums	278
1. Major Economies Forum on Energy and Climate	278
2. G-8/G-20	279
3. Bilateral initiatives	280
V. Sub-national climate governance	281
VI. Judicial governance	283
A. Functions of litigation	285
B. Source of law	287
C. Forum	288
D. Assessment	290
VII. Polycentric governance of the carbon market	290
VIII. Polycentric governance and the UN climate change regime	292
IX. Conclusion	293
Select Bibliography	294
9. Intersections between International Climate Change Law and Other Areas of International Law	295
I. Introduction	295
II. Climate change and human rights	296
A. Introduction	296
B. Distinguishing features of a human rights approach to climate change	298
C. Advantages and disadvantages of a human rights approach to climate change	299
D. Which human rights are affected by the impacts of climate change?	301
1. Extending the ambit of existing rights to address climate impacts	301
2. Recognizing a right to a healthy or clean environment	303
E. Nature of duties	304
1. Types of duties	304
2. Duty holders	307
3. Duty beneficiaries	308
F. Human rights implications of response measures	308
G. Human rights in the UN climate regime	309

III.	Climate change, migration, and displacement	313
	A. Introduction	313
	B. Existing international protection	315
	1. Internal displacement	315
	2. Cross-border displacement	318
	a) International refugee law	318
	b) International human rights law	320
	c) Law relating to statelessness	321
	C. Addressing gaps in protection	322
	D. Climate-induced displacement and migration in the UN climate regime	325
IV.	Climate change and trade	327
	A. The World Trade Organization	328
	B. GATT principles	330
	1. Trade disciplines	331
	2. Exceptions	332
	3. The dispute settlement process	333
	4. The relationship between trade rules and climate protection measures	334
	a) Unilateral or multilateral measures?	334
	b) Direct and indirect trade restrictions	336
	c) The role of the 'likeness' standard	338
	d) Criteria for assessing 'likeness'	338
	e) Processes and production methods (PPMs) and 'likeness'	339
	5. Trade-related climate measures	341
	a) Border adjustments	342
	b) Subsidies	343
	C. Trade in the UN climate regime	347
	Select Bibliography	349
10.	Conclusion	351
	I. The evolution of international climate change law: A brief recap	351
	II. Distinctive features of international climate change law	355
	III. Effectiveness of international climate change law	357
	IV. Looking ahead	360
	<i>Index</i>	363