

Vergiliana

Critical studies on the texts of
Publius Vergilius Maro

Egil Kraggerud

Contents

- : not published before
- : partly new or changed
- ☞ (floral heart): author's original conjecture
- ⊛ (white florette): past conjecture by another defended by me

<i>Preface</i>	xiv
Introduction	1
<i>Bucolica</i>	9
<i>Ecl. 1. 69 post aliquot aristas</i>	11
A disputed phrase in its context	
<i>Ecl. 2. 32 A god's title</i>	13
Pan the great innovator and model	
☞ <i>Ecl. 3. 62 A conjunction at stake</i>	14
Theocr. 5. 82 in the balance	
☞ <i>Ecl. 4. 8 One child initiating a new age</i>	16
A letter added can make a big difference	
<i>Ecl. 4. 28–9 Lines sharing words between them</i>	19
Emphasis achieved by artistry	
⊛ <i>Ecl. 4. 62–3 The nature of a baby's smile</i>	21
A Dutch scholar vindicated	
<i>Ecl. 5. 3 "Why don't we sit down?" in Latin</i>	23
What Vergil chose to write	

	<i>Ecl. 5. 8 Indicative or subjunctive?</i>	26
	In favour of <i>P</i>	
	<i>Ecl. 5. 38 The gender of <i>narcissus</i></i>	28
	Our debt to an ancient grammarian	
	<i>Ecl. 5. 66 Altars for Daphnis</i>	30
	Sorting out syntactical order	
	<i>Ecl. 6. 1–12. On the genesis of Vergil’s earliest poetry</i>	34
	Call. <i>Aet.</i> 1. 21–4 and Theocr. 16 as inspiration	
	<i>Ecl. 6. 16 Silenus’ hangover</i>	44
	The troublesome adverbial ‘cluster’ <i>procul tantum</i>	
✿(☞)	<i>Ecl. 6. 24 The commonest of verbs ousted by a <i>hapax</i>?</i>	47
	Peerlkamp’s brilliant point	
	<i>Ecl. 6. 34 A dilemma in <i>P</i></i>	51
	Elided <i>omnia</i> in Vergil?	
	<i>Ecl. 6. 74–81 A <i>praeteritio</i> to fill the day</i>	53
	The illustrative effect of complicated syntax	
	<i>Ecl. 7. 5 Equal and well–prepared singers</i>	55
	A misleading first impression of their qualities	
	<i>Ecl. 7. 29–32 Corydon’s promise to Diana</i>	58
	Variation on the usual contract between man and god	
	<i>Ecl. 7. 33–6 Thyrsis honouring Priapus</i>	61
	And, unfortunately, revealing his true self	
	<i>Ecl. 7. 37–44 Love of Galatea</i>	63
	The rivals’ respective ‘roles’	
✿	<i>Ecl. 7. 53–60 An inevitable transposition</i>	66
	What is either singer’s ‘part’?	
	<i>Ecl. 7. 64 Justice for Venus</i>	72
	Equality restored by an ancient grammarian	
•✿☞	<i>Ecl. 10. 44 A line revisited and clinched</i>	74
	Almost beyond belief: a double corruption	
	Notes	80

Georgica	95
(••) G. 1. 35 Present or perfect I? <i>P</i> and <i>ps.</i> Probus found trustworthy	97
G. 1. 36 Hope in Tartarus An example of disregarded <i>potentialis</i>	98
G. 1. 83 What does prefixed <i>in-</i> mean? On homonyms with contrary meaning	100
☞ G. 1. 500 Two false birds with one stone Minimal change can work wonders	110
••☞ G. 3. 159 An unnoticed example of <i>ecquis</i> A simplification apt to simplify future discussion	113
••☼ G. 3. 303–4 The reign of the cold Water Bearer A serious issue for goats	115
G. 3. 519 Present or perfect II? Weighing for and against	120
Notes	121
Aeneis I–IV	127
<i>Ille ego qui</i> The false beginning Yet requiring the best syntactical understanding	129
• A. 1. 1–7 Punctuation and structure The beneficiary effect of a full stop in the flow of lines	131
A. 1. 48–9 Indignant Juno A neglected modal parallelism	135
A. 1. 380 Jove’s descendant How Aeneas can escape criticism – and save half a line	137
A. 1. 458 The protagonists of the Trojan War On Seneca’s version	139
••☼ A. 1. 462 A persistent stumbling block? A personal approach to a conclusive answer	142

	A. 1. 603–5 A sense of justice and righteousness	149
	To whom do these virtues properly belong?	
••(✿)	A. 1. 646 A loving father's <i>cura</i>	153
	An analysis of the use of <i>carus</i>	
✿	A. 2. 121 Emphasis on a terrifying Apollo	156
	Madvig's support of an anonymous conjecture	
☞	A. 2. 139 On an unmotivated <i>et</i>	158
	Restoration via <i>scriptura continua</i>	
	A. 2. 433–4 A genitive seeking its governing noun	160
	From another vantage point: 'retributive actions' in context	
	A. 2. 485 In defence of <i>V</i> (and Geymonat)	162
	A good, but lonely, singular needs strengthening	
•	A. 2. 567–88 The Helen episode – a never-ending debate?	164
	If accepting (1) that it is by Vergil and/or (2) meant to fill a lacuna	
	A. 2. 598 Accusative or nominative?	166
	A real <i>pro et contra</i> case	
☞	A. 2. 738 The heart-breaking loss of Creusa	167
	A proper emendation is a natural response	
	A. 2. 749 An interpolated line?	169
	The <i>hysteron proteron</i> diagnosed	
••☞	A. 3. 417 On Helenus' prophecy I	171
	A challenging instance of abl. <i>medio</i>	
✿	A. 3. 684–6 On Helenus' prophecy II	173
	Nisbet's conjecture and the final clause	
	A. 4. 112 <i>Foedera</i> or <i>foedere</i>?	175
	A reading to give Venus' rhetoric an edge?	
✿	A. 4. 126 A terminable intrusion	176
	Negatively affecting the context if accepted	

✿	A. 4. 176 The birth of Fama How Bährens did away with Fama's timidity	179
☞	A. 4. 223–4 Jupiter describing Aeneas at Carthage Restoration of the god's words by lenient surgery	181
☞	A. 4. 375 On the language of strong emotion Within acceptable linguistic bounds	184
	A. 4. 469–73 Dido ~ (1) Pentheus and (2) Orestes (1) Allen introduced the Maenads, (2) <i>ego</i> the scene of the matricide	187
	Notes	190
<i>Aeneis</i> V–VIII		199
•	A. 5. 300 A runner's name and origin <i>Parisinus</i> Lat. 7306 accepted	201
	A. 5. 851 Treacherous weather Much hinges on what <i>et</i> combines	205
••	A. 6. 153 Animals to soothe the nether deities <i>Pecudes</i> as the <i>chief</i> expiatory rite	206
••✿	A. 6. 293 'Hollow forms' Bentley's reading adopted	208
••	A. 6. 438 In need of final consensus An opportunity to side with Timpanaro and Conte	210
•	A. 6. 460 Vergil 'imitating' Catullus A jocular phrase becomes a tragic confession	212
••	A. 6. 466 Aeneas' last words to Dido An attempt to solve an enigma of grammatical analysis	217
	A. 6. 561 'Air' or 'ear'? The function of either in context	221

••	A. 6. 585–6 Punctuation and punishment The place of a full stop is no trifle	223
••☞	A. 6. 588 Where did Salmoneus challenge Zeus? On the function of the adjective <i>medius</i>	226
••	A. 6. 601–2 Should we miss Tantalus? In other words: is the text sound, corrupt or lacunose?	228
••☞	A. 6. 615 A hidden hendiadys It will emerge if one letter is taken away	231
••☞	A. 6. 658–9 Eridanus below and above ground Horsfall is only one letter from goal	233
	A. 6. 746 Present or perfect III? <i>PR</i> , Serv. and Tib. Don. preferred	236
••✿	A. 6. 761 The hopeless <i>lucis loca</i> Heinsius' suggestion seeks followers	237
••	A. 6. 791 Punctuation to be changed Why <i>Hic vir hic</i> is recommended with no comma	238
	A. 6. 817–23 <i>Utor Brutus</i> Capital <i>Utrumque</i> as part of an interpretation	239
	A. 6. 846 Predicting a Fabius as Maximus Cunctator The way Vergil imitates Ennius	242
•(☞)	A. 6. 852 Global rule over the <i>populi</i> Half a line grasping its essence	244
☞	A. 6. 893–6 The troublesome exit from Hades What if lines 897–8 are put before 893–6 (excluding 896)?	246
	A. 7. 129 'Disasters' or 'exile'? In support of R.D. Williams	257
••✿	A. 7. 377 A queen's maenadic arena An interpretation based on Jasper's extension of that arena	258

••✿	A. 7. 543 A hellish creature flies to heaven	261
	In support of Schaper's (Deuticke's) and Conte's dative	
☞	A. 7. 598–9 An old king's tragedy	263
	Is the transmitted text compatible with truth and logic?	
	A. 7. 741 The annoying <i>soliti</i>	267
	The simple solution should as always be heeded	
••	A. 7. 773 A <i>locus solubilis</i>?	270
	Critics favouring <i>P</i> have many good points	
	Notes	272
	<i>Aeneis</i> IX–XII	285
	A. 9. 51 The right place of a comma	287
	Word-order reflects the <i>viva vox</i> of the commander	
☞	A. 9. 79 Cybele's eternal fame	288
	Where a 'but' is ill-placed	
	A. 9. 85–6 A questionable deletion	289
	The forest of Mount Ida differentiated	
	A. 9. 91 Cybele's concern for the Trojan fleet	291
	A postponed <i>neu</i> emphasizing	
	A. 9. 130 Jupiter at war with the Trojans	292
	To understand Turnus' sneer <i>M</i> is preferred	
••	A. 9. 140–2 Misogyny <i>sub iudice</i>	295
	To acquit the form <i>perosos</i> a comma (141) has to go	
•(☞)	A. 9. 215 Nisus' request for burial	298
	Peerlkamp was on the right track	
	A. 9. 243 In defence of a <i>future simple</i>	301
	It is indeed an issue according to ms. evidence	
✿	A. 9. 363 A spurious line?	303
	A definite stand may be close on duty	

••	A. 9. 390–2 Where to put a question mark	306
	A final decision is yet to be reached	
•❁	A. 9. 402–3 Nisus praying to Luna	309
	With the author's late recognition of Ribbeck's brilliance	
	A. 9. 461–4 Turnus arming his ranks	311
	The author's confidence in Wagner and <i>M</i>	
	A. 9. 471 The neglected variant makes its claims	313
	<i>P</i> was accepted by La Cerda	
••	A. 9. 481 The gender of a predicative pronoun	315
	<i>R</i> is still without enough support	
❁	A. 9. 539 <i>Le mot juste</i>	317
	Schrader's proposal unearthed	
	A. 9. 599 'War' or 'death'?	320
	Burmannus helps to make the appropriate decision	
⌚	A. 9. 709 A solitary neuter	322
	One's reaction to an anomaly has its reasons	
⌚	A. 9. 733 The shield of Turnus	323
	A description that confuses with its variants	
	A. 9. 764 The back of fleeing fighters	325
	An irregularity is sacrificed	
	A. 9. 789 A true dilemma	326
	Ablative, genitive or dative?	
••	A. 10. 366 More than a personal palinode	327
	Not only Madvig's <i>aquis</i> , but also my own <i>eos</i> must go	
••❁	A. 10. 705 Paris' name twice over?	329
	Ellis against triumphant Bentley	
⌚	A. 11. 50 The troublesome <i>et</i> yet again	332
	The solution is presented under <i>A. 2. 139</i>	

☞	A. 11. 256 An abnormal pronoun	333
	Vergil's usage wins the day	
••	A. 12. 161 A pompous mustering of forces	335
	Whereby a comma has to change its place	
••☞☼	A. 12. 218 Brackets or no brackets?	337
	A long-winded path towards emendation	
••	A. 12. 286 Latinus' report of failure	341
	The hidden reference of <i>referens</i>	
	A. 12. 470 Present or perfect IV?	343
	<i>V</i> should take the pride of place in the app. crit.	
(☼)	A. 12. 648 Why not the easy way?	344
	Wagner's case against Housman's	
••	A. 12. 790 Exhausted heroes	347
	On how to combine and interpret five words	
	Notes	349
	<i>References</i>	357
	<i>Index philologorum recentiorum</i>	361