

Fifth Edition

UNDERSTANDING SCIENTIFIC REASONING

Ronald N. Giere

*Department of Philosophy
Minnesota Center for Philosophy of Science
University of Minnesota*

John Bickle

*Department of Philosophy
Neuroscience Graduate Program
University of Cincinnati*

Robert F. Mauldin

*Department of Natural Sciences
Shawnee State University*



CONTENTS

PREFACE xi

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS xv

Chapter 1

WHY UNDERSTAND SCIENTIFIC REASONING? 1

- 1.1 Why Study Scientific Reasoning? 1
- 1.2 Some Preliminary Examples 2
 - The Expanding Universe 2
 - Global Warming 3
 - Cigarette Smoking and Coronary Heart Disease 4
 - Summary 4
- 1.3 How to Study Scientific Reasoning 5
 - How Should We Understand Scientific Reasoning? 5
 - General Strategy 6
 - A Computer Analogy 6
 - Tactics 7
 - Reasoning as a Skill 7

Part One

THEORETICAL HYPOTHESES 9

Chapter 2

UNDERSTANDING AND EVALUATING THEORETICAL HYPOTHESES 11

- 2.1 The Double Helix: A Case Study 11
 - The Three-Chain Model 12
 - The Two-Chain Model 15
- 2.2 Understanding Episodes in Science 18
 - The Human Context of Science 18
 - Exploring How the World Works 19
 - Finding a Problem 20
 - Constructing Models 20
 - Deciding Whether a Model Fits 20

| | | |
|------|---|----|
| | Convincing Others | 20 |
| | Spreading the Word | 21 |
| 2.3 | Models and Theories | 21 |
| | Scale Models | 21 |
| | Analog Models | 21 |
| | Models and Maps | 22 |
| | Theoretical Models | 24 |
| | Theoretical Hypotheses | 25 |
| | Theories | 26 |
| 2.4 | Data from the Real World | 27 |
| 2.5 | Predictions from Models | 28 |
| 2.6 | The Components of a Scientific Episode | 29 |
| 2.7 | Evaluating Theoretical Hypotheses | 31 |
| | Evidence That a Model Does Not Fit the Real World | 31 |
| | Evidence That a Model Does Fit the Real World | 32 |
| 2.8 | A Program for Evaluating Theoretical Hypotheses | 34 |
| 2.9 | Why the Program Works | 36 |
| 2.10 | How the Program Works: Three Examples | 37 |
| | A Case of Negative Evidence | 38 |
| | A Case of Positive Evidence | 39 |
| | A Case of Inconclusive Data | 40 |
| 2.11 | Crucial Experiments | 41 |
| | The Structure of Crucial Experiments | 41 |
| | Analysis of a Crucial Experiment | 43 |
| 2.12 | Model Development | 44 |
| | A Case of Model Development | 46 |
| | Exercises | 47 |

Chapter 3

HISTORICAL EPISODES 58

| | | |
|-----|--|----|
| 3.1 | The Phases of Venus | 58 |
| 3.2 | Isaac Newton and Halley's Comet | 63 |
| | Newtonian Models | 63 |
| | Halley's Comet | 66 |
| 3.3 | The Downfall of the Phlogiston Theory | 67 |
| 3.4 | Darwin and Evolution | 69 |
| | Special Creation | 70 |
| | Darwin's Finches | 70 |
| | Darwin's Model of Evolutionary Development | 72 |
| 3.5 | Mendelian Genetics | 75 |
| | Mendel's Original Experiments | 75 |
| | Mendel's Model | 76 |
| | The Backcross Test | 78 |

- 3.6 The Revolution in Geology 80
 Mobilism 81
 Seafloor Spreading 82
 Magnetism, Geomagnetism, and Paleomagnetism 83
 Exercises 86

Chapter 4

MARGINAL SCIENCE 92

- 4.1 Freudian Psychology 93
 Freud's Theory 93
 The Case of Little Hans 94
 Freud's Hypothesis 95
- 4.2 Astrology 96
 The Predictions Are Vague 98
 There Are Multiple Predictions 98
 Astrology as an Interpretative Framework 99
- 4.3 Extraterrestrial Visitation 99
 An Alternative Model 100
 What about the Data? 100
- 4.4 Reincarnation 101
 In Search of Bridey Murphy 101
- 4.5 Extrasensory Perception 103
 Clairvoyance 103
 Speaking of Probability 104
- 4.6 The Burden of Proof 104
 Exercises 105

Part Two

STATISTICAL AND CAUSAL HYPOTHESES 111

Chapter 5

STATISTICAL MODELS AND PROBABILITY 113

- 5.1 Why Statistical and Probabilistic Models are Important 113
- 5.2 The Elements of a Statistical Study 114
 The Real-World Population 114
 The Sample 115
 A Model of the Population 115
 A Model of the Sample 115
 Putting the Elements Together 115
- 5.3 Proportions and Distributions 116
 Proportions 117
 Variables 117
 Distributions 118

| | | |
|------|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 5.4 | Simple Correlations | 119 |
| | Variables not Correlated | 120 |
| | Variables Correlated | 120 |
| | Summary | 122 |
| 5.5 | Symmetry of Correlations | 122 |
| 5.6 | Strength of Correlations | 124 |
| 5.7 | Probability Models | 125 |
| | A Probability Model | 125 |
| | Simple Addition Rule | 126 |
| | Simple Multiplication Rule | 127 |
| | Conditional Probabilities | 128 |
| 5.8 | The Flippant Judge | 129 |
| | The Problem | 129 |
| | The Solution | 130 |
| 5.9 | Sampling | 131 |
| | Replacement | 131 |
| | Random Sampling: Two Trials | 132 |
| | Three, Four, and Five Trials | 134 |
| 5.10 | Large Samples | 137 |
| | Expected Frequency | 137 |
| | Standard Deviation | 137 |
| | The Value of Large Samples | 141 |
| 5.11 | Sampling with Unequal Probabilities | 142 |
| | Appendix | 143 |
| | Correlation Coefficient | 143 |
| | Exercises | 144 |

Chapter 6

| | | |
|--|---|------------|
| EVALUATING STATISTICAL HYPOTHESES | | 147 |
| 6.1 | Estimation | 147 |
| | Margin of Error | 149 |
| | Sample Size and Margin of Error | 149 |
| | Confidence Level and Margin of Error | 150 |
| | Sample Frequency and Margin of Error | 152 |
| 6.2 | Evaluating Distributions and Correlations | 152 |
| | Evaluating Distributions | 152 |
| | Evaluating Correlations | 152 |
| | Evidence for a Correlation | 153 |
| | Lack of Evidence for a Correlation | 154 |
| | Estimating the Strength of a Correlation | 156 |
| | Confidence Levels for Correlations | 156 |
| 6.3 | Statistical Significance | 157 |
| | Statistically Significant Differences | 157 |
| | Statistical Significance and Strength of Correlations | 158 |
| | Evaluating Correlations: a Quick and Dirty Method | 159 |

- 6.4 Survey Sampling 159
 - The 1997–98 Health Behavior in School-Aged Children (HBSC) World Health Organization (WHO) Cross-National Survey 160
 - How the Survey was Carried Out 161
 - Selected Data 162
- 6.5 Evaluating Statistical Hypotheses 167
 - The Real-World Population 167
 - Sample Data 171
 - A Statistical Model 172
 - Random Sampling 172
 - Evaluating the Hypothesis 173
 - Summing Up 173
- 6.6 A Program for Evaluating Statistical Hypotheses 175
 - Physical Fighting 177
 - Weapon Carrying in Self-Defense 179
- 6.7 Problems with Survey Sampling 180
 - Nonrandom Sampling 180
 - Unreliability of Information 181
 - The Exit Polls Discrepancy in the 2004 U.S. Presidential Election 182
 - Appendix 184
 - Formula for Margin of Error 184
 - Formula for Statistically Significant Differences 185
 - Formula for Correctly Adding Margins of Error 185
 - Exercises 185

Chapter 7

CAUSAL MODELS 196

- 7.1 Correlation and Causation 196
 - Correlation without Causation 196
 - Causation is not Symmetric 197
 - Causal Production 197
- 7.2 Causal Models for Individuals 198
 - A Deterministic Model 198
 - Could Humans be Deterministic Systems? 199
 - A Probabilistic Model 200
- 7.3 Causal Models for Populations 201
 - A Comparative Model for Causation in Populations 201
 - What if the Individuals are Probabilistic? 203
- 7.4 Effectiveness of Causal Factors 203
 - Effectiveness in Individuals 204
 - Effectiveness in Populations 204
- 7.5 Summary: How Causation Differs from Correlation 204
 - Exercises 205

Chapter 8**EVALUATING CAUSAL HYPOTHESES 208**

- 8.1 Saccharin and Cancer 208
- 8.2 Randomized Experimental Designs 210
 - Real-World Population and Causal Hypothesis 210
 - Sample Data 211
 - Experimental Design 211
 - Random Sampling 212
 - Evaluating the Causal Hypothesis 213
 - Program for Evaluating Causal Hypotheses Of Rats and Humans 216
- 8.3 Double-Blind Studies 218
- 8.4 Schizophrenia and Heredity 220
 - Combined Results from Five Recent Twin Studies 222
- 8.5 Prospective Designs 224
 - Controlling for Other Variables 226
 - Prospective versus Randomized Experimental Designs 229
- 8.6 Schizophrenia Etiology and the *Dystrobrevin-Binding Protein 1 (DTNBP1) Gene* 231
- 8.7 Retrospective Designs 234
 - Nonrandom Selection of the Experimental Group 234
 - Constructing the Control Group 235
 - Controlling for Other Variables 235
 - Retrospective Studies and Survey Sampling 237
 - Effectiveness and Retrospective Studies 239
 - Evaluating Retrospective Studies 239
- 8.8 Statistical Evidence for Causal Hypotheses 241
 - Can Prospective Studies Prove a Causal Connection? 243
 - The Ethics of Experimental Design 244
 - New Trends in Biomedical Research 244
- 8.9 Summary 246
 - Exercises 247

Part Three**KNOWLEDGE, VALUES, AND DECISIONS 263****Chapter 9****MODELS OF DECISION MAKING 265**

- 9.1 Options 265
- 9.2 States of The World 266
- 9.3 Outcomes 266

- 9.4 Values 267
 - Ranking Values 267
 - Measuring Values 267
- 9.5 Scientific Knowledge and Decision Strategies 268
- 9.6 Decision Making with Certainty 269
 - Highest Value Strategy 269
- 9.7 Decision Making with Complete Uncertainty 270
 - Better and Worse Options 270
 - Best Options 271
 - Satisfactory Options 271
 - Playing It Safe 272
 - Gambling 273
 - Gambling versus Playing It Safe 273
- 9.8 Decision Making with Risk 274
 - Expected Value 275
 - Is the Expected-Value Strategy the Best Strategy? 276
- 9.9 Modern Utility Theory 277
 - Ramsey's Insight 277
 - A Fictional Case 278
 - Maximizing Expected Utility 279
 - Von Neumann-Morgenstern Utility Theory 280
 - Another Fictional Case 282
- 9.10 Summary of Decision Strategies 284
 - Exercises 284

Chapter 10

EVALUATING DECISIONS 289

- 10.1 A Program for Evaluating Decisions 289
- 10.2 Decisions Involving Low Probabilities 290
 - Oral Contraceptives and Breast Cancer 290
- 10.3 Decisions Involving Moderate Probabilities 292
 - The Smoking Decision 292
 - Further Considerations 295
 - Confronting Your Values 296
- 10.4 Policy Decisions with Uncertainty 297
 - Global Warming 297
 - Whose Decision is It, Anyway? 299
 - Exercises 299

INDEX 303

CREDITS 319