

# Content

## Part I Adaptive Logics as a Framework for Defeasible Logics

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b> . . . . .	3
1.1	Defeasible Reasoning . . . . .	3
1.2	Towards the Formalization of Defeasible Reasoning . . . . .	6
	References . . . . .	9
<b>2</b>	<b>The Standard Format for Adaptive Logics</b> . . . . .	11
2.1	The Standard Format . . . . .	11
2.2	The Lower Limit Logic . . . . .	12
2.3	The Abnormalities . . . . .	13
2.4	The Adaptive Strategy . . . . .	14
2.4.1	The Reliability Strategy . . . . .	15
2.4.2	The Minimal Abnormality Strategy . . . . .	23
2.4.3	A Special Case: The Simple Strategy . . . . .	29
2.5	Modeling Defeasibility in Adaptive Proofs . . . . .	30
2.5.1	Internal and External Dynamics . . . . .	30
2.5.2	Comparing the Strategies . . . . .	33
2.5.3	Adaptive Logics and Plausible Reasoning . . . . .	35
2.6	Some Properties of ALs in Standard Format . . . . .	42
2.6.1	Properties of the Adaptive Consequence Relations . . . . .	42
2.6.2	Some Remarks on Computational Complexity . . . . .	46
2.6.3	Excursus on the Rational Properties . . . . .	46
2.7	The Necessity of Superimposing Classical Connectives . . . . .	50
2.8	Normal Selections: A ‘Credulous’ Strategy that is not in the Standard Format . . . . .	53
	References . . . . .	57
<b>3</b>	<b>Sequential Combinations of ALs</b> . . . . .	59
3.1	The Consequence Relation of CAL . . . . .	60
3.2	Semantics for Sequential ALs . . . . .	65

3.2.1	Soundness and Completeness for Reliability . . . . .	68
3.2.2	Soundness and Completeness for Some Other Special Cases . . . . .	70
3.3	A Proof Theory for CAL . . . . .	73
3.3.1	The Proof Format . . . . .	73
3.3.2	Preparing for the Marking Definitions . . . . .	75
3.3.3	The <i>i</i> -Marking for the Reliability Strategy . . . . .	76
3.3.4	The <i>i</i> -Marking for the Minimal Abnormality Strategy . . . . .	78
3.3.5	An Alternative to the inh-marking for Some Special Cases . . . . .	81
3.4	Normal Selections . . . . .	82
3.5	Conclusion . . . . .	83
	References . . . . .	84
<b>4</b>	<b>On the Transparency of Defeasible Logics: Equivalent Premise Sets, Equivalence of Their Extensions, and Maximality of the Lower Limit . . . . .</b>	<b>85</b>
4.1	Formats for Logics for Defeasible Reasoning . . . . .	85
4.2	Equivalent Premise Sets . . . . .	88
4.3	Equivalent Premise Sets and ALs . . . . .	91
4.4	Characterizations Under a Translation . . . . .	95
4.5	Extensions of Equivalent Premise Sets . . . . .	96
4.6	Maximality of the Lower Limit Logic . . . . .	99
4.7	In Conclusion . . . . .	102
	References . . . . .	103
<b>5</b>	<b>Generalizing the Standard Format . . . . .</b>	<b>107</b>
5.1	Introduction . . . . .	107
5.2	Some Examples . . . . .	109
5.2.1	The Standard Format: Minimal Abnormality . . . . .	110
5.2.2	Lexicographic ALs . . . . .	111
5.2.3	Counting Abnormalities . . . . .	113
5.2.4	A Most Skeptical Rationale: Reliability . . . . .	114
5.2.5	Colexicographic ALs . . . . .	116
5.2.6	The Problem of Non-Smoothness . . . . .	117
5.2.7	More Refined Quantitative Examples . . . . .	119
5.2.8	Summary . . . . .	121
5.3	The Generic Adaptive Logic $AL_{\Lambda}$ . . . . .	122
5.3.1	The Semantics . . . . .	124
5.3.2	The Dynamic Proof Theory . . . . .	124
5.4	Representational Results for $AL_{\Lambda}$ . . . . .	130
5.4.1	A Representational Theorem for $\Vdash_{AL_{\Lambda}}$ . . . . .	131
5.4.2	The Complete Stage of an Adaptive Proof . . . . .	131

5.4.3	A Representational Theorem For $\vdash_{\mathbf{AL}_\Lambda}$ and Related Results . . . . .	132
5.4.4	Soundness and Completeness . . . . .	134
5.5	Other Meta-Theoretic Properties of $\mathbf{AL}_\Lambda$ . . . . .	135
5.5.1	Cumulativity and Equivalent Premise Sets . . . . .	135
5.5.2	Some Classes of Cumulative $\Lambda$ -Based ALs . . . . .	138
5.5.3	Reassurance . . . . .	139
5.5.4	The Upper Limit Logic and the Maximality of the Lower Limit Logic . . . . .	140
5.5.5	Further Properties . . . . .	141
5.6	Simplifying the Proof-Theory for a Subclass of $\Lambda$ -Based ALs . . . . .	142
5.7	Normal Selections: The Logic $\mathbf{AL}_\Lambda^n$ . . . . .	143
5.8	Wrapping Things Up: Some Concrete Classes of $\Lambda$ -Based ALs . . . . .	145
5.8.1	The Threshold Functions $\min_{\prec}$ , $\Psi_{\prec}$ , and $\Psi_{[\prec_1, \dots, \prec_n]}$ . . . . .	145
5.8.2	The Standard Format . . . . .	146
5.8.3	(Co)-Lexicographic ALs . . . . .	147
5.8.4	More on Quantitative Variants . . . . .	148
5.9	Conclusion . . . . .	150
	References . . . . .	152

## Part II Default Reasoning

<b>6</b>	<b>Adaptively Applying Modus Ponens in Conditional Logics of Normality . . . . .</b>	<b>157</b>
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	157
6.1.1	Some Background . . . . .	157
6.1.2	Contribution and Structure of this Chapter . . . . .	159
6.2	Conditional Logics, Their Core Properties and Related Work . . . . .	160
6.3	Modus Ponens in Conditional Logics of Normality . . . . .	163
6.4	Applying Modus Ponens Conditionally . . . . .	166
6.5	Discussion . . . . .	172
6.5.1	Some Advantages of the Adaptive Approach . . . . .	172
6.5.2	The Drowning Problem . . . . .	174
6.5.3	Taking Into Account Negative Knowledge . . . . .	175
6.6	Conclusion and Outlook . . . . .	176
	References . . . . .	176

<b>7</b>	<b>An Adaptive Logic for Rational Closure</b> . . . . .	181
7.1	Rational Closure . . . . .	184
7.1.1	Preferential Entailment . . . . .	186
7.1.2	Rational Entailment . . . . .	188
7.1.3	Ranked and Rational Models . . . . .	189
7.1.4	Constructing a Model for Rational Closure . . . . .	192
7.2	An AL for Rational Closure . . . . .	193
7.2.1	The Logic $\mathbf{R}$ . . . . .	194
7.2.2	The Lower Limit Logic $\mathbf{R}^+$ . . . . .	195
7.2.3	The Adaptive Logic $\mathbf{ARC}^s$ . . . . .	200
7.3	Including Negative Knowledge . . . . .	204
7.4	Conclusion . . . . .	204
	References . . . . .	205

### Part III Argumentation Theory

<b>8</b>	<b>Towards the Proof-Theoretic Unification of Dung's Argumentation Framework: An Adaptive Logic Approach</b> . . . . .	209
8.1	Introduction . . . . .	209
8.2	Dung's Argumentation Framework: Key Terms . . . . .	211
8.3	A Logic for Abstract Argumentation . . . . .	214
8.3.1	Language and Rules . . . . .	214
8.3.2	Representing AFs as Premise Sets . . . . .	218
8.3.3	Representational Requirements . . . . .	219
8.3.4	Interpreting a Premise Set as Normally as Possible . . . . .	220
8.3.5	The Problem of an Interpretative Surplus . . . . .	221
8.3.6	A Better Solution: Going Adaptive and Enabling External Dynamics . . . . .	223
8.3.7	External Dynamics: Letting New Information In . . . . .	226
8.3.8	The Minimal Abnormality Strategy and Final Derivability . . . . .	227
8.4	The AL Framework for Skeptical Acceptance . . . . .	230
8.5	Adaptive Logics for Credulous Acceptance . . . . .	233
8.6	Discussion . . . . .	237
8.7	Conclusion . . . . .	239
	References . . . . .	239
<b>9</b>	<b>Allowing for Joint Attacks</b> . . . . .	243
9.1	Motivation . . . . .	243
9.2	Complex Argumentation Frameworks . . . . .	244
9.3	Extension Types . . . . .	246
9.4	Allowing for Joint Attacks in the Lower Limit Logics . . . . .	247

9.5	Representing Complex Argumentation Frameworks as Premise Sets. . . . .	249
9.6	Going Adaptive . . . . .	250
9.7	Conclusion. . . . .	253
	References . . . . .	253

## Part IV Deontic Logics

<b>10</b>	<b>Avoiding Deontic Explosion by Contextually Restricting Modal Inheritance . . . . .</b>	<b>257</b>
10.1	Introduction . . . . .	257
10.2	Dealing with Deontic Conflicts by Restricting Inheritance. . .	259
10.3	The Semantics of <b>DPM</b> . . . . .	262
10.4	Some Shortcomings of <b>DPM</b> . . . . .	263
10.5	Adaptive Logics . . . . .	265
10.6	The Adaptive Logic <b>ADPM.1</b> . . . . .	267
10.7	The Adaptive Logic <b>ADPM.2'</b> . . . . .	271
10.8	Some Meta-Theoretical Properties. . . . .	273
10.9	Shortcomings and Related Work. . . . .	274
10.10	Conclusion. . . . .	276
10.11	Outlook . . . . .	277
	10.11.1 Obligation-Permission Conflicts: Towards More Conflict-Tolerant Deontic Logics . . . . .	277
	10.11.2 Going Conditional. . . . .	278
	References . . . . .	279
<b>11</b>	<b>An Adaptive Logic Framework for Conditional Obligations and Deontic Dilemmas . . . . .</b>	<b>281</b>
11.1	Introduction . . . . .	281
11.2	The Problem With Strengthening the Antecedent . . . . .	283
11.3	Lou Goble's <b>CDPM</b> . . . . .	284
11.4	A Critical Analysis . . . . .	286
	11.4.1 <b>CDPM.1c</b> Validates (PRatMono) . . . . .	286
	11.4.2 Explosive Behavior and Other Problems With (WRM) . . . . .	286
	11.4.3 Solving the Problems by Further Restricting (WRM) . . . . .	287
	11.4.4 A Problem with Aggregation and (S) . . . . .	288
11.5	Going Adaptive: The Conditional Case . . . . .	289
	11.5.1 Applying Inheritance Conditionally. . . . .	290
	11.5.2 Applying Weak Rationality Conditionally . . . . .	291

11.6	Combining the Adaptive Systems . . . . .	293
11.7	Conclusion. . . . .	294
	References . . . . .	295
<b>12</b>	<b>A Deontic Logic Framework Allowing for Factual Detachment . . . . .</b>	<b>297</b>
12.1	Introduction . . . . .	297
12.1.1	Monadic Approaches to Conditional Obligations. . .	298
12.1.2	Dyadic Approaches and the Problem of Detachment . . . . .	299
12.1.3	The Contribution and Structure of this Chapter. . . .	300
12.2	What to Detach?. . . . .	301
12.2.1	Exceptional Contexts and Specificity. . . . .	302
12.2.2	Violation Contexts and Contrary-to-Duty Obligations. . . . .	303
12.2.3	The Dissent in the Literature . . . . .	304
12.2.4	Instrumental and Proper Obligations . . . . .	306
12.2.5	Carmo and Jones' Proposal . . . . .	309
12.3	Formally Realizing Detachment . . . . .	311
12.3.1	Blocking Proper Detachment . . . . .	313
12.3.2	Blocking Instrumental Detachment . . . . .	314
12.3.3	Realizing Detachment by an Adaptive Logic . . . . .	314
12.4	A Generic Adaptive Logic for Detachment . . . . .	315
12.5	A Lower Limit: Lou Goble's <b>CDPM</b> . . . . .	316
12.6	Handling Detachment Adaptively . . . . .	318
12.6.1	Context Shifts. . . . .	320
12.6.2	Deontic Conflicts . . . . .	324
12.7	Modeling Nested Permissible Contexts . . . . .	325
12.7.1	Generalizing $L^+$ for Nested Permissible Contexts. . . . .	325
12.7.2	Adaptively Applying Detachment . . . . .	329
12.8	Discussion . . . . .	330
12.9	Conclusion. . . . .	332
	References . . . . .	332
	<b>Appendices . . . . .</b>	<b>335</b>
	<b>References . . . . .</b>	<b>432</b>
	<b>Index . . . . .</b>	<b>433</b>