

Analytical Contents

Acknowledgements *V*

Abbreviations *X*

INTRODUCTION *I*

1 Preliminaries *I*

1 Aim and Scope of this Study *I*

2 Corpus of Grammars and Error Books *9*

3 Composition of the Linguistic Material *13*

4 System of Reference - Form of quotations *17*

2 Linguistics and Pseudo-Linguistics in the 19th Century *19*

1 Basic Trend: the emergence of the historical-comparative school *19*

2 Linguistics in the Anglo-Saxon Countries *20*

3 The Ethos of 19th Century English Grammar *25*

0 Introduction *25*

1 The Appeal to Historical Grammar as a Normative Device *25*

2 Deductive Approaches to Language *26*

3 Empiric Approaches to Language - The Appeal to Usage *31*

4 Conclusion - The Province of the Grammarians *33*

PART ONE - NUMBER RELATIONS *35*

Chapter I - Collectives *35*

1 The Views of the Grammarians *35*

1 1 Current prescription *35*

1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking *36*

1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking *36*

2 The Facts of Usage *42*

2 1 Animate referents *42*

2 2 Inanimate referents *53*

2 3 Joint data for animate and inanimate referents *56*

2 4 Relative frequencies of singular and plural patterns
per individual collective *57*

3 Conclusion *66*

Chapter II - Indefinites *67*

1 The Views of the Grammarians *67*

1 1 Current prescription *67*

1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking *67*

1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking *68*

2 The Facts of Usage *73*

2 1 Verb agreement *73*

2 2 Pronoun agreement *78*

2 3 Transition from singular to plural patterning *86*

2 4 Assessment of plural pronoun reference *87*

2 5 Verb and pronoun agreement with *none* *90*

3 Conclusion *94*

Chapter III - Multiple Head Phrases Joined by And-like Connectors *96*

1 The Views of the Grammarians *96*

1 1 The connector is AND *96*

1 1 1 Current prescription *96*

1 1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking *96*

1 1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking *97*

1 2 The connector is WITH *105*

1 2 1 Current prescription *105*

1 2 2 Chart of grammatical thinking *106*

1 2 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking *106*

- 1 3 The connector is AS WELL AS 108
 - 1 3 1 Current prescription 108
 - 1 3 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 108
 - 1 3 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 109
- 2 The Facts of Usage 110
 - 2 1 The connector is AND 110
 - 2 1 1 The and-phrase in general 110
 - 2 1 2 Animate referents 112
 - 2 1 3 Inanimate referents 113
 - 2 1 4 Sub-classes of multiple head phrases with and-connector 114
 - 2 2 The connector is WITH 126
 - 2 3 The connector is AS WELL AS 127
- 3 Conclusion 129

Chapter IV - Multiple Head Phrases Joined by Or-like Connectors 131

- 1 The Views of the Grammarians 131
 - 1 1 Current prescription 131
 - 1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 132
 - 1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 132
 - 1 3 1 Multiple head phrases consisting of singular constituent parts 132
 - 1 3 2 Multiple head phrases having constituents of different numbers 134
 - 1 3 3 Multiple head phrases having constituents of different genders or persons 136
 - 1 3 4 In summary 137
- 2 The Facts of Usage 138
 - 2 1 Multiple head phrases consisting of singular constituents 138
 - 2 2 Multiple head phrases consisting of constituents of different numbers 144
- 3 Conclusion 145

Chapter V - Subject Heads Modified by Postposed Plural Adjuncts 146

- 1 The Views of the Grammarians 146
 - 1 1 Current prescription 146
 - 1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 146
 - 1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 147
 - 1 4 Appendix: *One of + plural adjunct + relative clause* 149
- 2 The Facts of Usage 150
 - 2 1 Head noun + plural adjunct + verb 150
 - 2 2 The pattern: *One of + plural adjunct + relative clause* 152
- 3 Conclusion 154

Chapter VI - The Copula Placed between Heads of Different Numbers 155

- 1 The Views of the Grammarians 155
 - 1 1 Current prescription 155
 - 1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 155
 - 1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 156
- 2 The Facts of Usage 159
- 3 Conclusion 162

Chapter VII - There + Verb + Plural Head 164

- 1 The Views of the Grammarians 164
 - 1 1 Current prescription 164
 - 1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 164
 - 1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 164
- 2 The Facts of Usage 165
- 3 Conclusion 168

PART TWO - CASE RELATIONS 169

Chapter I - The Subject of the Gerund 169

- 1 The Views of the Grammarians 169
 - 1 1 Current prescription 169
 - 1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 169
 - 1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 170

- 2 The Facts of Usage 177
 - 2 1 Preliminaries 177
 - 2 2 Overall survey of numerical data 179
 - 2 3 Genitive modifiers alternating with oblique personal pronouns 180
 - 2 4 The covert subject is *this, both, all*, etc. or a group such as: *either of us, all of them*, etc. 182
 - 2 5 The genitive of a noun identifying animates alternating with the unmarked form 183
 - 2 6 The genitive of a noun identifying inanimates alternating with the unmarked form 188
 - 2 7 In summary 188
- 3 Conclusion 189

Chapter II - Who in Object Territory and Whom in Subject Territory 180

- 1 The Views of the Grammarians 190
 - 1 1 Non-distinctively marked *wh*-forms in object territory 190
 - 1 1 1 Current prescription 190
 - 1 1 2 Brief survey of grammatical thinking 190
 - 1 1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 190
 - 1 2 *Whom* in subject territory as initiator of complex relative and interrogative constructions 192
 - 1 2 1 Current prescription 192
 - 1 2 2 Analysis of grammatical thinking 193
- 2 The Facts of Usage 194
 - 2 1 Non-distinctively marked *wh*-forms in object territory 194
 - 2 1 1 Interrogative *wh*-forms 194
 - 2 1 2 Relative *wh*-forms 198
 - 2 2 *Whom* in subject territory as initiator of complex relative and interrogative constructions 199
 - 2 2 1 Complex relative clause 199
 - 2 2 2 Complex interrogative clause 201
- 3 Conclusion 201

Chapter III - Accusative Forms of Personal Pronouns in Nominative Territory and vice versa 203

- 1 The Views of the Grammarians 203
 - 1 1 Predicative pronouns in equational constructions 203
 - 1 1 1 Current prescription 203
 - 1 1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 203
 - 1 1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 204
 - 1 2 Pronouns in various isolated positions 208
 - 1 2 1 Current prescription 208
 - 1 2 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 208
 - 1 2 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 209
 - 1 3 Pronouns after: *than, as, like, but, except(ing), save* 210
 - 1 3 1 *Than* and *as* 210
 - 1 3 1 1 Current prescription 210
 - 1 3 1 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 210
 - 1 3 1 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 211
 - 1 3 1 4 Appendix - *Than whom* 216
 - 1 3 2 *Like* 216
 - 1 3 3 *But* 217
 - 1 3 3 1 Current prescription 217
 - 1 3 3 2 Chart of grammatical thinking 218
 - 1 3 3 3 Analysis of grammatical thinking 218
 - 1 3 4 *Except(ing)* and *save* 220
 - 1 3 4 1 *Except(ing)* 220
 - 1 3 4 2 *Save* 221
- 2 The Facts of Usage 222
 - 2 1 Predicative pronouns in equational constructions 222
 - 2 2 Pronouns in various isolated positions 225
 - 2 2 1 Nominative forms according to strict grammar 225
 - 2 2 2 Accusative forms according to strict grammar 227

2 3	Pronouns after: <i>than, as, like, but, except(ing), save</i>	228
2 3 1	<i>Than</i> and <i>as</i>	228
2 3 1 1	Nominative forms according to strict grammar	228
2 3 1 2	Accusative forms according to strict grammar	234
2 3 1 3	Appendix - <i>Than whom</i>	235
2 3 2	<i>Like</i>	236
2 3 3	<i>But</i>	237
2 3 3 1	Nominative forms according to strict grammar	237
2 3 3 2	Accusative forms according to strict grammar	239
2 3 4	<i>Except(ing)</i> and <i>save</i>	240
2 3 4 1	<i>Except(ing)</i>	240
2 3 4 2	<i>Save</i>	240
2 4	Succinct syntheses of main numerical data	241
3	Conclusion	244

Chapter IV - Case Relations in Multiple Head Phrases 246

1	The Views of the Grammarians	246
1 1	Coordinate multiple heads	246
1 1 1	Current prescription	246
1 1 2	Analysis of grammatical thinking	246
1 2	Appositive multiple heads	248
1 2 1	Current prescription	248
1 2 2	Analysis of grammatical thinking	249
2	The Facts of Usage	249
2 1	Coordinate multiple heads	249
2 1 1	Nominative according to strict grammar	249
2 1 2	Accusative according to strict grammar	251
2 2	Appositive multiple heads	254
2 2 1	Nominative according to strict grammar	254
2 2 2	Accusative according to strict grammar	255
3	Conclusion	256

CONCLUSIONS 259

1	Survey of the Overall Trends of Grammatical Thinking	259
2	Evaluation of Recorded Discrepancies between Grammar and Usage	266
3	The Two Strata of Diction	270
4	The Diachronic Shifts of Usage	272
5	Final Assessment of the Influence of Grammar on Usage	275

APPENDICES 281

Appendix I - Textual Evidence Relating to the Ethos of 19th Century English Grammar 281

1	The Appeal to Logic	281
2	The Appeal to Universal Grammar	284
3	The Appeal to Usage	286

Appendix II - Surveys of Frequency Distributions in the Corpus 290

Appendix III - Some Statistical Tests - Tables of Statistical Significance 320

1	Some Statistical Tests	320
2	Tables of Statistical Significance	329

Appendix IV - Bibliography 331

A	Corpus of Linguistic Material	331
B	Corpus of 19th Century Grammars and Error Books	333
C	Additional Corpus of 18th and 19th Century Works Referred to or Consulted	336
D	General Bibliography of Works and Articles Referred to or Consulted	337