

Representation of Language

*Philosophical Issues in a Chomskyan
Linguistics*

GEORGES REY



OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Brief Contents

<i>Guide to the Reader</i>	xxv
Introduction and Synopsis	1
PART I. THE CORE LINGUISTIC THEORY	
1. The Core Galilean Idea and Some Crucial Data	13
2. The Basics of Generative Grammars	45
3. Competence/Performance: Determinate I- vs. E-languages	93
4. Knowledge and the Explanatory Project	129
PART II. THE CORE PHILOSOPHICAL VIEWS	
5. Grades of Nativism: From Projectible Predicates to Quasi-Brute Processes	151
6. Resistance of Even Mental Realists and the Need for Representational Pretense	184
7. Linguistic Intuitions and the Voice of Competence	222
PART III. INTENTIONALITY	
8. Chomsky and Intentionality	261
9. Linguistic Ontology	295
10. Linguo-Semantics	336
11. Psycho-Semantics of Perceptual Content	363
<i>References to Works of Chomsky</i>	391
<i>General References</i>	395
<i>Glossary of idiosyncratic terms and abbreviations</i>	427
<i>Name Index</i>	429
<i>General Index</i>	436

Detailed Contents

<i>Guide to the Reader</i>	xxv
Introduction and Synopsis	1

PART I. THE CORE LINGUISTIC THEORY

1. The Core Galilean Idea and Some Crucial Data	13
1.1 An Internalist “Galilean” Idealization	13
1.1.1 Internalist vs. Social Conceptions	13
1.1.2 A Galilean Theory and Crucial Data	16
1.2 Competence vs. Performance	19
1.3 Typical WhyNots	21
1.3.1 Purely Syntactic Cases	27
(i) Island Constraints	27
(ii) Constraints on Contraction	28
(iii) Ellipses	30
(iv) Parasitic Gaps	30
1.3.2 Possibly Mixed Syntax, Semantics, or Pragmatic Cases	31
(i) Binding Phenomena	31
(ii) (Negative/Positive) Polarity Items (NPIs/PPIs)	33
(iii) Structural Constraints on Meaning	34
1.4 Performance Issues	35
1.4.1 Grammatical but Unacceptable	35
1.4.2 Acceptable but not Grammatical	36
1.5 Further Evidence	38
1.5.1 Productivity	38
1.5.2 Creativity	38
1.5.3 Relations Between Forms	39
1.5.4 Constrained Homophony (or “Ambiguity”)	39
1.5.5 Stability of Acquisition	40
1.5.6 Speed of Stable Acquisition	40
1.5.7 Poverty and Corruption of Stimulus Data	41
1.5.8 No Negative Data	41
1.5.9 Independence of General Intelligence	41
1.5.10 A “Critical Period”	42
1.5.11 Universality of Grammatical Principles and Parameters	42
1.5.12 Spontaneous Languages of the Deaf	44
1.5.13 Absence of Logically Simple Languages	44
1.5.14 “The Linguists’ Paradox”	44

2. The Basics of Generative Grammars	45
2.1 Philosophical Beginnings	45
2.2 Stages of the Core Theory	46
2.2.1 Logical Constructivism: LSLT and Syntactic Structures	48
2.2.2 Psychology and Explanatory Adequacy: the “Standard” “Aspects” Model	54
2.2.3 From Phonemes to Features	57
2.2.4 Constraining the Rules: The Extended Standard Model	59
2.2.5 Resisting Teleo-tyranny: Semantics and “the Autonomy of Syntax”	62
(i) Teleo-tyranny	62
(ii) Surprising Consequences for Linguistics	65
2.2.6 Generative vs. Interpretive Semantics	67
2.2.7 GB/P&P: Addressing Plato’s Problem and Linguistic Diversity	71
2.2.8 Crucial Move from Hypothesized Rules to Mechanical Principles	74
2.2.9 The Minimalist Program	75
2.2.10 The “Third Factor”: Darwinian and Neural Speculations	80
2.3 Some Simple Proposed Explanations	82
2.3.1 C-command	82
2.3.2 (Negative) Polarity Items	83
2.3.3 Binding Phenomena	86
2.4 Conclusion	91
3. Competence/Performance: Determinate I- vs. E-languages	93
3.1 Conventional vs. Non-Conventional Grammars	94
3.2 I- vs. E-language	97
3.3 Behaviorism and Quine’s Problems	102
3.3.1 The Motivations for Behaviorism	102
3.3.2 The Poverty of Behaviorism	105
3.3.3 Extensionally Equivalent Grammars	107
3.3.4 Explicit vs. Implemented (“Implicit”) Rules and Structures	113
3.4 Other Superficialist Objections	117
3.4.1 “Nothing Hidden” (Wittgenstein, Ryle, Baker and Hacker, and Chater)	117
3.4.2 Homunculi (Harman and V. Evans)	121
3.4.3 “Kripkenstein”: Errors and <i>Ceteris Paribus</i> Clauses	123
4. Knowledge and the Explanatory Project	129
4.1 Explanatory Adequacy	130
4.2 “Knowledge”	132
4.3 Non-Conceptual Content	137
4.4 An Explanatory vs. a Working Epistemology	139
4.5 Computational-Representational Theories (“CRT”s)	143

PART II. THE CORE PHILOSOPHICAL VIEWS

5. Grades of Nativism: From Projectible Predicates to Quasi-Brute Processes	151
5.1 Innate and Learned!	154
5.2 The Poverty of the Stimulus	157
5.3 Plato's Problem?	161
5.4 General Statistical ("GenStat") Approaches	162
5.4.1 Simple Induction	162
5.4.2 Goodman's Problem of Projectibility	164
5.4.3 Bayesian Strategies	168
5.4.4 Empirical Difficulties	170
5.4.5 Leibniz's Problem of Modality	172
5.4.6 Quine's Problem of Behavioral Indeterminacy	175
5.4.7 Quasi-Brute Process Nativism	176
5.5 Usage Based Strategies	179
5.6 Conclusion	181
6. Resistance of Even Mental Realists and the Need for Representational Pretense	184
6.1 Initial Red Herrings	185
6.1.1 Prescriptivism	185
6.1.2 Consciousness	186
6.2 Platonism	187
6.2.1 The "Type" Argument	189
6.2.2 The "Necessity" Argument	190
6.2.3 The "Veil of Ignorance" Argument	192
6.2.4 Platonism's Need of Psychology	194
6.3 Devitt's "Linguistic Reality" (LR)	195
6.3.1 Fundamentally Different Concerns	198
6.3.2 Bee Dances and Natural Language	200
6.3.3 Competence and Its Outputs	202
6.3.4 Structural vs. Processing Rules	203
6.3.5 Conventions	205
6.3.6 Devitt's Ontological Argument	208
6.4 Literal Form of Principles and Parameters	213
6.4.1 Representational Pretense	213
6.4.2 A Reassuring Postscript about Pretense	218
6.5 A Somewhat Ecumenical Conclusion: Internalist and Externalist Interests	219

7. Linguistic Intuitions and the Voice of Competence	222
7.1 A “Voice of Competence”?	222
7.1.1 Devitt’s Skepticism about (Non-)Standard Models	224
7.1.2 I- vs. E-languages	226
7.1.3 Devitt’s Alternative Proposal	228
7.2 Parsing and Perception	233
7.2.1 Linguistic Perception as Parsing	235
7.2.2 Non-Conceptual Content Again: NCSDs	240
7.2.3 Having vs. Representing Properties	242
7.2.4 How Would NCSDs Help?	247
7.3 The Evidence	249
7.3.1 Involuntary Phonology	250
7.3.2 “Meaningless” Syntax	252
7.3.3 Syntax Trumping “the Message”: Garden Paths, Structural Priming, and “Slips of the Ear”	254
7.4 Conclusion	257

PART III INTENTIONALITY

8. Chomsky and Intentionality	261
8.1 Intentionality	262
8.2 Chomsky as Intentionalist	267
8.3 The Controversy	271
8.4 Chomsky as Anti-Intentionalist	272
8.5 Collins’ Abstract-Algebraic Reading	276
8.5.1 As an Interpretation of Early Chomsky	276
8.5.2 Collins’ Positive Proposal	279
8.6 Chomsky’s <i>De Re</i> Reading of “Representation of”	286
8.7 Empty Intentional Representations and “Intentional Inexistents”	289
9. Linguistic Ontology	295
9.1 Background	295
9.1.1 Intentionality and Ontology	295
9.1.2 Resisting General Anti-Realism	296
(i) General Anti-Realism	296
(ii) Deciding Ontology	302
(iii) Stable Cases	303
(iv) Unstable Cases: Secondary Properties	304
(v) Non-Preservative Cases	306
9.2 The Problems with SLEs	307
9.2.1 “Beads on a String”	308
9.2.2 Efficiency and Noise	309
(i) Communicative Efficiency	310
(ii) Noisy Transduction	311
9.3 Dispositional Strategies	315

9.4	Articulatory Idealizations	316
9.5	Speaker Intentions?	319
9.6	SLEs as Abstract Objects	320
9.7	“Psychological Reality”	322
9.8	SLEs as Neural items	325
9.8.1	Use/Mention Confusions	325
9.8.2	SLEs as Neural items— <i>Deliberate Use/Mention Neural Collapse</i>	328
9.8.3	Intentional Object/Representation Confusions	330
9.9	Folieism: SLEs as Perceptual Inexistents	331
10.	Linguo-Semantics	336
10.1	Linguo- vs. Psycho-semantics	337
10.2	Meaning and the Analytic	338
10.2.1	The Analytic Data	338
10.2.2	Quinean Challenges	339
(i)	Revisability	340
(ii)	Confirmation Holism	341
(iii)	Reductionism	343
(iv)	Explanatory Role	345
10.3	The Disjunction Problem and BasicAsymmetries	349
10.4	A Promising Application to Language	356
10.4.1	Meaning without Truth	356
10.4.2	A Cautionary Aside: Resisting More Anti-realism	360
11.	Psycho-Semantics of Perceptual Content	363
11.1	Sensitivities to Abstruse Phenomena	364
11.2	Probabilities, Disjunctions, and BasicAsymmetries	371
11.2.1	Sensitivities as BasicAsymmetries	371
11.2.2	Perception as Probabilistic Confirmation	373
11.3	Concluding Remarks on Meth(odological)-Dualism	378
11.3.1	Motivations for Meth-Dualism	379
11.3.2	Mind/Body Problems	382
	<i>References to Works of Chomsky</i>	391
	<i>General References</i>	395
	<i>Glossary of idiosyncratic terms and abbreviations</i>	427
	<i>Name Index</i>	429
	<i>General Index</i>	436