

Debating  
**EVOLUTION**  
before  
**DARWINISM**

An Exploration of Science and Religion  
in America, 1844–1859

Ryan C. MacPherson, Ph.D.  
author of *Rediscovering the American Republic*

MANKATO, MINNESOTA  
INTO YOUR HANDS LLC  
2015

# CONTENTS

## INTRODUCTION

### Theology and the Natural Sciences in the Decades Preceding Darwinism

Recalling the Era of <i>Vestiges</i> .....	7
The Aim and Organization of This Study .....	16
Three Theological Distinctive Local Academic Case Studies: Princeton, Harvard, and Yale .....	17
A Concept of “Science” during the Era of <i>Vestiges</i> .....	21
Study Questions .....	28

## CHAPTER ONE

### America: The *Vestiges of Creation* Crosses the Atlantic

Introduction .....	29
First Contact .....	31
From Lamarck to <i>Vestiges</i> , or from <i>Vestiges</i> Back to Lamarck? .....	38
American Reviewers Introduce and Evaluate <i>Vestiges</i> .....	43
The Nebular Hypothesis: Did It All Begin as a Fire-Mist? .....	49
Spontaneous Generation: Whence the First Living Cell? .....	52
Fossils, Facts, and Opinions: Debating Progress while Denying Transmutation .....	54
Embryology and Macleay’s Circles of Life: Living Evidence for Transmutation? .....	58
Interpreting the Theology of <i>Vestiges</i> .....	61
Study Questions .....	64

## CHAPTER TWO

### Princeton: *Vestiges* Meets the Scientific Sovereignty of God

Introduction .....	65
The Presbyterian Setting: Princeton College and Princeton Theological Seminary .....	68
The <i>Princeton Review</i> : Defending Science against <i>Vestiges</i> .....	82
Student Life after <i>Vestiges</i> : The Development Theory Becomes an Undergraduate Pastime .....	88
The Curriculum: Preparing Students to Protect Science from <i>Vestiges</i> .....	95
From Princeton to the American Association for the Advancement of Science .....	102
The Limits of God’s Sovereignty at Princeton .....	105
Concluding Interpretations: Understanding <i>Vestiges</i> at Princeton .....	110
Study Questions .....	116

## CHAPTER THREE

### Harvard: *Vestiges* Meets the Unitarian Character of Science

Introduction .....	117
The Unitarian Setting: Harvard College and Harvard Divinity School .....	121
“Cutting up of <i>Vestiges</i> ”: Asa Gray Slashes <i>Vestiges</i> at the Lowell Institute .....	135
“In fact no history at all”: Francis Bowen Rejects <i>Vestiges</i> ’ Speculative Natural History .....	138
Asa Gray’s Dialogue with the Author of <i>Vestiges</i> .....	143
The Shibboleth of Speculative Geology: Blocking a <i>Vestiges</i> Sympathizer from the Faculty .....	151
Louis Agassiz’s Lowell Lectures: God’s Thoughts against the Development Theory .....	157
The Rev. Joseph Henry Allen Probes the Moral Character of <i>Vestiges</i> .....	169
“That book we have wanted so long”: Transcendentalists Welcome <i>Vestiges of Creation</i> .....	174

Defending the Divine Inspiration of Scripture: The Dudleian Lectures against <i>Vestiges</i> .....	180
Unveiling the Author of <i>Vestiges</i> ? .....	184
“God’s thoughts manifested in tangible realities”: Agassiz’s Natural Theology of Species Fixity .....	189
Asa Gray: A Botanist Preferring Natural Development over Agassiz’s Theory .....	197
Concluding Interpretations: Understanding <i>Vestiges</i> at Harvard .....	200
Study Questions .....	204

## CHAPTER FOUR

### **Yale: *Vestiges* Meets the Moral Government of God**

Introduction .....	205
The “New Haven Theology” Setting: Yale College and Theological Department .....	209
The New Haven Design Argument: Taylor’s Systematic Theology .....	215
Benjamin Silliman: The Precedence of Geology over Theology and Philology .....	219
Silliman’s Crusade for Geology against <i>Vestiges</i> .....	227
James Dwight Dana: The Formation of a Geological Prophet .....	235
Edward Hitchcock: Theologian of Geology .....	244
The Dana–Lewis Debate of 1856–1857: A Controversy between Two Theological Sciences .....	252
Dana’s “Thoughts on Species” (1857) .....	258
Dana and the Development Theory in 1859 .....	265
Concluding Interpretations: Understanding <i>Vestiges</i> at Yale .....	267
Study Questions .....	270

## CONCLUSION

### ***Vestiges of Creation Leaves a Legacy***

Introduction .....	271
Interpreting <i>Vestiges</i> in Three Theologically Shaped Academic Communities .....	274

Applying a Model of Socially Situated Systematic Theology beyond the Era of <i>Vestiges</i> .....	277
A Word for the Present .....	283
Study Questions .....	286

**METHODOLOGICAL POSTSCRIPT**  
**Socially Situated Systematic Theologies**

Some Lessons from Max Weber and Robert Merton .....	287
Paul Tillich's Systematic Theology as a Hermeneutic for Historical Analysis .....	293
From "Common Context" to Theological Specificity .....	300
Study Questions .....	311

**APPENDICES**

Appendix A: Reviews of <i>Vestiges</i> in American Periodicals and Pamphlets .....	312
Appendix B: Nineteenth-century American Reprints of <i>Vestiges</i> .....	314
Appendix C: Manuscript Conventions .....	315

**BIBLIOGRAPHIES**

Archival Collections Examined .....	317
Articles Cited: Unknown Authors .....	321
Articles Cited: Known Authors .....	322
Books and Pamphlets Cited: Unknown Authors .....	325
Books and Pamphlets Cited: Known Authors .....	326
Dissertations Cited .....	335
Conference Papers Cited .....	335
Acknowledgments .....	337
Index .....	342
About the Author .....	352